```
1
                   UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                     NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
2
                         WESTERN DIVISION
3
    UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, - Docket No. 3:10-cr-522
4
5
       Plaintiff,
                                   Toledo, Ohio
                                  September 7, 2011
6
                                  Trial
           V.
7
    ALEX DAVID COOK,
8
       Defendant.
9
                             VOLUME 3
                        TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL
10
               BEFORE THE HONORABLE JAMES G. CARR
            UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE, AND A JURY
11
    APPEARANCES:
12
13
    For the Plaintiffs: United States Attorneys' Office
                          By: Thomas O. Secor
                               Gene Crawford
14
                          Four SeaGate, Suite 308
15
                          Toledo, OH 43604
                          (419) 259-6376
16
    For the Defendant:
                          Elizabeth Kelley
                          Suite 285
17
                          13938 A Cedar Road
18
                          Cleveland, OH 44118-3204
                          (216) 410-6923
19
    Court Reporter:
                          Tracy L. Spore, RMR, CRR
20
                          1716 Spielbusch Avenue
                          Toledo, Ohio 43624
                          (419) 213-5520
21
22
23
    Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography,
24
    transcript produced by notereading.
25
```

```
(Reconvened at 1:38 p.m.)
        1
        2
                         (Jury enters the courtroom.)
00:00:01
                         THE COURT: Ms. Kelley, who is your witness,
        3
            and what are we likely to hear?
00:00:03
        4
                         Ms. Kelley, who is your witness?
00:00:04
        5
00:00:12
                         MS. KELLEY: I'm sorry. I just heard
        6
        7
            witness, and I went and got him.
00:00:14
                         We are calling Dr. Wayne Graves to the
00:00:16
        8
00:00:18
            stand.
                     And he is expected to testify as to whether
            someone like Alex with his reading disability would
00:00:24
       10
00:00:28
            knowingly sign a statement without understanding it or
       11
00:00:33
       12
            having adequate time to examine it.
00:00:38
       13
                         THE COURT: Sir, you may come forward.
                         (The witness was sworn by the clerk.)
00:00:56
       14
00:01:10
       15
                         THE COURT: Will you tell the ladies and
            gentlemen your name, please.
00:01:12
       16
       17
                         THE WITNESS: My name is Wayne Graves, Ph.D.
00:01:14
00:01:20
       18
                         THE COURT: What is your community of
            residence?
00:01:21
       19
00:01:22
       20
                         THE WITNESS: I live in Swanton, Ohio.
00:01:24
       21
                         THE COURT: Okay. And what is your
00:01:26
       22
            occupation or profession?
                         THE WITNESS: I'm a clinical and forensic
00:01:27
       23
00:01:29
       24
            psychologist.
       25
                         THE COURT: And what does that mean?
00:01:30
```

```
THE WITNESS: Well, I'm a psychologist who
00:01:33
        1
            spends about half my time working with clinical problems
00:01:35
        2
            in people, and the other half working with clinical
00:01:40
        3
00:01:45
            problems as they apply to some legal question, something
        4
            to deal with a question before the courts or something
00:01:50
        5
00:01:55
            that has legal aspects to it.
        7
                         THE COURT: And how long have you been doing
00:01:58
            that sort of work?
00:02:02
        8
        9
                                        Thirty-three years.
00:02:04
                         THE WITNESS:
00:02:06
       10
                         THE COURT: And what was your training and
       11
            education and certifications and so forth?
00:02:11
                         THE WITNESS: I received a bachelor with
00:02:14
       12
00:02:18
       13
            honors in psychology from Indiana University, Ph.D. in
            clinical psychology in 1976 from the University of
00:02:22
       14
00:02:27
       15
            Toledo. I did an internship in -- on the east coast in
            Baltimore at Shepherd Pratt and Springfield Hospital
00:02:31
       16
            Center. And I did a residency and my early training at
00:02:35
       17
            Court Diagnostic and Treatment Center, which is the
00:02:39
       18
00:02:42
       19
            local forensic psychiatry center. I ran that agency
00:02:47
       20
            until 1982. And I've been in private practice since
00:02:54
       21
            then.
00:02:54
       22
                         THE COURT: And I apologize, but I -- if I
00:03:00
       23
            can get my computer to cooperate, will you tell me your
00:03:03
       24
            name again.
       25
                         THE WITNESS: Wayne Graves, G-r-a-v-e-s.
00:03:04
```

```
00:03:11
        1
                         THE COURT: Ms. Kelley.
00:03:12
                         MS. KELLEY: Thank you. Based on what Dr.
        2
            Graves just told us, I would ask that he be qualified as
00:03:14
        3
00:03:17
            an expert.
        4
                         THE COURT: Any objection to his giving his
00:03:18
        5
00:03:21
            opinion?
        6
        7
                         MR. CRAWFORD: No, Your Honor.
00:03:21
00:03:21
                         THE COURT: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, let
        8
            me say, Ms. Kelley -- it's a personal idiosyncrasy, but
00:03:25
        9
            we lawyers commonly refer to a witness who has some
00:03:32
       10
            special skill or training, education, or experience as,
00:03:35
       11
            quote, an expert. And with that label, the law entitles
00:03:38
       12
00:03:44
       13
            them -- and actually it's with those qualifications,
            skill, and training -- label to one side -- the law
00:03:48
       14
00:03:51
       15
            entitles them to give opinions on various subject
            matters within their field of education, training, and
00:03:54
       16
            experience. So he's being called for that purpose.
00:03:59
       17
00:04:03
       18
                         Okay. Go ahead.
00:03:22
       19
00:03:22
       20
                      WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., DIRECT EXAMINATION
            BY MS. KELLEY:
00:04:04
       21
00:04:04
       22
                   Good afternoon, Doctor.
               Q.
00:04:06
       23
               Α.
                   Good afternoon.
00:04:08
       24
               Q.
                   Do you know the defendant in this case, Alex
      25
            Cook?
00:04:10
```

- 1 Α. I do.
- And please tell the jury how you know him. 2 Q.
- I performed an evaluation of Mr. Cook. And I did 3 Α. it for his -- for what was his public defender in June 00:04:18 4 of this year. I met him on two -- well, May of this year. I met him on two occasions.
 - Q. You met him on two occasions. And how long did you meet with him on both occasions?
 - Α. I had two hours of face-to-face time, plus I had him in the office another two or three hours doing other testing kinds of endeavors.
 - Q. And tell the jury about the testing that you performed.
 - First I tested his ability to read and spell and tested his mathematical calculation skills. asked him to do two personality inventories, which were computer -- one of them is computer administered, the other one was paper and pencil administered because of some issues that I don't remember now, but it was later put into the computer.
 - Ο. Excuse me. Was it an issue with the computer or was it an issue with Alex?
 - Α. I believe that it was an issue with our computer timing rather than with Alex.

These two instruments are pretty commonly used

- 00:04:10
- 00:04:11
- 00:04:13
- 00:04:26
- 00:04:31
- 7 00:04:33
- 00:04:36 8
- 00:04:38
- 00:04:43
- 00:04:49 11
- 00:04:54 12
- 00:04:56 13
- 00:04:57 14
- 00:05:04 15
- 00:05:08 16
- 00:05:13 17
- 00:05:16 18
- 00:05:21 19
- 00:05:25 20
- 00:05:27 21
- 00:05:30 22
- 00:05:33 23
- 00:05:36 24
- 25 00:05:42

personality inventories, one of them about current 00:05:45 1 issues and one about longer term personality problems or 00:05:48 2 types. One of them is called the MMPI, Minnesota 00:05:53 3 00:06:01 Multiphasic Personality Inventory. The other one is 4 called the Milan Personality Inventory III. 00:06:05 00:06:12 And did you perform any other types of tests? 6 I asked him to complete the adult -- I'm sorry, Α. 7 00:06:14 the psychosexual life history adult male form, which was 00:06:20 8 00:06:24 a take-home eight-page questionnaire that he brought back with him the next time. 00:06:28 10 Q. All right. And did you review any documents 00:06:30 11 00:06:37 12 either in preparation for the interviews or for writing 00:06:42 13 your final report? I had available at the time that I did the 00:06:44 14 evaluation his educational records. 00:06:47 15 All right. 00:06:50 16 Q. And the records of his -- I'm going to refer to 00:06:50 17 Α. 00:06:57 18 my report. Before you do that, Doctor --00:06:57 19 Q. 00:07:00 20 Α. I did have available records from the offense 00:07:06 21 itself including the statement that he had signed, the 00:07:11 22 descriptions of the websites that he was to have gone 00:07:15 23 to, the indictment, the description of the offenses. 00:07:21 24 Q. And when you said earlier that you reviewed

educational records, what specifically do you mean?

25

00:07:24

```
Alex was in special education for his entire
00:07:27
        1
               Α.
            grade school and high school career. He had testing
00:07:35
        2
            called individualized education plans, IEPs, and some
00:07:40
        3
            specific additional testing that was multifactored
00:07:47
        4
            evaluations called -- that were available to me.
00:07:51
00:07:55
            were two IEPs and one section of the multifactored
        6
        7
            evaluation.
00:07:59
               Q. Now, a few moments ago, Doctor, you touched what
00:08:01
        8
00:08:04
            you called your report. I'm handing you what's
            previously been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 101.
00:08:06
00:08:11
            Could you please tell the jury what that is.
       11
00:08:18
       12
               Α.
                    This is a marked up copy of an early edition of
00:08:37
       13
            my report. It does not have my letterhead; it does not
            have headers on it.
00:08:43
       14
00:08:47
       15
                   But it is your report?
               Q.
                    I haven't examined it entirely. It's not signed.
00:08:53
       16
            It looks like it's very close to the final product.
00:08:57
       17
                         MS. KELLEY: I apologize, Your Honor.
00:09:11
       18
                         Your Honor, could I retrieve that copy of
00:09:19
       19
00:09:22
       20
            the report?
                         THE COURT: Of course.
00:09:23
       21
00:09:40
       22
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Could we approach the side for
00:09:42
       23
            a second?
00:09:43
       24
                         THE COURT: Of course.
       25
                         (Whereupon the following discussion was had
00:09:44
```

```
at the bench outside the hearing of the jury:)
00:11:33
        1
        2
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Judge, we've seen one copy of
00:11:33
            a report; no previous drafts, no marked up drafts.
00:11:33
        3
            have no idea --
00:11:33
        4
                         MS. KELLEY: This is the report that I was
00:11:33
        5
00:11:33
            given. And his office, because I had a marked up copy,
            I contacted his office and I said, please send me a
        7
00:11:33
            clean final copy, which he did. And that, in turn, was
00:11:34
        8
            e-mailed to you and a copy to the Court.
00:11:34
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Judge, I've seen no prior
00:11:34
       10
       11
            drafts that are marked up.
00:11:34
00:11:34
       12
                         MS. KELLEY: I'm not using them. This is my
00:11:34
       13
            personal copy. If not, I won't use it. You have the
00:11:35
       14
            same copy that he has.
00:11:35
       15
                        MR. SECOR: I thought he said it was marked
00:11:35
       16
            up.
                         MS. KELLEY: I would ask for two minutes to
       17
00:11:35
            go and download from Amy's computer that document.
00:11:35
       18
                         MR. CRAWFORD: I think it's hearsay anyway.
00:11:35
       19
00:11:35
       20
            It can be used for prior inconsistent statements, but to
            admit an expert report --
00:11:35
       21
00:11:35
       22
                         THE COURT: Why don't you ask him his
00:11:35
       23
            opinions.
00:11:35
      24
                         MS. KELLEY: But it is the same report.
            It's computer ignorance on my part.
      25
00:11:35
```

```
(End of sidebar discussion.)
00:11:35
        1
            BY MS. KELLEY:
00:11:42
        2
00:11:45
                  Based on the review of the documents and your
        3
               Q.
            interview with Alex, do you have an opinion based on a
00:11:47
        4
            reasonable degree of medical certainty as to why Alex
00:11:54
        5
00:11:59
            might sign a supposed confession?
        6
        7
                    I have an opinion to a reasonable degree of
00:12:05
               Α.
            psychological certainty --
00:12:09
        8
00:12:10
               Q.
                   All right.
        9
                   -- about why Alex might do that, yes.
00:12:11
       10
               Α.
                   Please tell the jury that opinion.
00:12:14
       11
               Ο.
00:12:15
       12
               Α.
                   Well, it essentially is that because of Alex's
00:12:19
       13
            learning disabilities that he lived with his whole life
            throughout school, he didn't really trust his own
00:12:23
       14
            ability to read and make sense of written information.
00:12:27
       15
            He also, because of that, was somewhat dependent on
00:12:34
       16
            authority figures and was inclined to give in to people
00:12:38
       17
            in authority and would not necessarily trust his own
00:12:44
       18
            reading of something that was in front of him.
00:12:52
       19
00:12:55
       20
                   Now, I want to clarify, Doctor, is Alex stupid or
               Q.
            unintelligent?
00:13:02
       21
00:13:03
       22
                    Alex has somewhere between low average and
00:13:06
       23
            average intellectual functioning, tested at that level.
00:13:12
       24
            But he also has learning disabilities in reading,
       25
            expressive language, as in written language, and
00:13:17
```

```
calculation or math skills, and they've been identified
00:13:20
        1
            consistently throughout his school career.
00:13:25
        2
                    Does that come from lack of trying or lack of
00:13:30
        3
               Q.
00:13:35
            ability?
        4
                    It usually comes from some lack of ability from
00:13:37
00:13:42
            some neurologic miswiring that takes place that
            interferes with information coming in and being
        7
00:13:49
00:13:52
            translated appropriately.
        8
                    And you stated earlier that you gave Alex a
00:13:55
               Q.
            number of tests, correct?
00:13:58
       10
               A. Yes.
00:13:59
       11
00:14:01
       12
                    Do you think he was applying himself when he was
00:14:05
       13
            taking those tests?
                    I think he was putting reasonably good effort
00:14:07
       14
00:14:11
       15
            into those tests with one exception.
                   All right. And tell the jury about that.
00:14:14
       16
               Q.
                    There was one long computer test. The MMPI II is
00:14:16
       17
               Α.
                         Somewhere in the last 200 of those items
00:14:25
       18
            567 items.
            apparently Alex lost focus or interest, and it looks as
00:14:31
       19
00:14:39
       20
            if he did not stay on task or answered potentially
            random. It's a long test for somebody with a reading
00:14:43
       21
00:14:48
       22
            disability.
00:14:48
       23
                    Would it be fair to say that Alex just doesn't do
00:14:51
       24
            well on long examinations?
       25
               A. It would be fair.
00:14:54
```

- Now, do you have any indication that maybe Alex 00:14:58 1 Q. was malingering on your tests? 2
 - Meaning that he was trying to look more Α. defective?
 - Ο. Yes.
 - Actually I thought his effort was pretty good. thought he wanted to appear competent. I didn't -there are indicators in the two personality testing instruments that allow me to decide his approach to the testing, and both of them were making it look as if he was making good effort and was not trying to look particularly dysfunctional.
 - Now you said, as I recall, that you spent approximately two hours face to face with him.
 - Α. Yes.
 - That would be two one-hour sessions? Ο.
 - Two one-hour sessions on two different days. Α.
 - Did he feel comfortable with you, if you know, or Ο. did he appear comfortable with you?
 - Α. He got more comfortable over time. I don't think Alex feels terribly comfortable with anybody, but he got more comfortable by the second session.
 - Did you ever feel that Alex was in a position to confide in you?
 - A. Well, I was asking fairly intimate complicated

- 00:15:03
- 00:15:07

00:15:10

3

4

- 00:15:12 5
- 00:15:13 6
- 7 00:15:16
- 00:15:22 8
- 00:15:27
- 00:15:30 10
- 00:15:35 11
- 00:15:38 12
- 00:15:42 13
- 00:15:45 14
- 00:15:48 15
- 00:15:48 16
- 00:15:50 17
- 00:15:57 18
- 00:16:00 19
- 00:16:03 20
- 00:16:06 21
- 00:16:12 22
- 00:16:16 23
- 00:16:20 24
- 25 00:16:23

```
questions about him and about his family and about his
00:16:26
        1
            sex life and about his experiences that are typically
00:16:30
        2
            not easy to talk about, and he was relatively open.
00:16:35
        3
               Q. Did he talk to you about being molested as an
00:16:39
        4
            11-year-old?
00:16:44
00:16:46
               Α.
                   I don't think so.
        6
        7
               Q. All right. Did he talk to you about teaching
00:16:48
            Sunday school?
00:16:51
        8
               A. I have no memory of him bringing that up.
00:17:06
        9
               Q. Did he ever talk to you about an ex-fiancee'?
00:17:08
       10
               A. Yes.
00:17:11
       11
00:17:14
       12
                         THE COURT: A what? I didn't hear your
00:17:16
       13
            question. Talk to you about a what?
                         MS. KELLEY: Ex-fiancee'.
00:17:18
       14
                    He said he had a girlfriend with whom he was
00:17:22
       15
            sexually active which ended with this -- these charges.
00:17:25
                    So she was -- she was only an ex-girlfriend?
00:17:30
       17
               Q.
00:17:34
                   He called her a girlfriend.
       18
               Α.
                   Not a fiancee'?
00:17:35
       19
               Q.
00:17:37
       20
               Α.
                   He did not.
00:17:42
       21
               Q. Now, I want to go back to the tests you performed
00:17:46
       22
            as to his, I guess, sexual development and education;
00:17:52
       23
            would that be correct?
00:17:53
       24
               Α.
                   Yes.
               Q. Any indications of deviancy during the course of
00:17:55
       25
```

that testing? 00:18:00 1 Using the word "test," I'm pretty careful about 00:18:05 2 what I described as a test. What I gave him was a life 00:18:10 3 history questionnaire about psychosexual issues, and it 00:18:13 4 asks a bunch of questions about psychosexual 00:18:17 5 00:18:21 development. So it's not a test in the sense that it's 7 normed. It's not a test in the sense that it allows any 00:18:27 kind of clear comparison against standards. It's a 00:18:31 8 00:18:39 questionnaire. So there's a lot of room about how he answers it, and it's answered in essay form, some of it. 00:18:42 10 Okay. Was there an opportunity for Alex to 00:18:46 11 Ο. 00:18:50 12 discuss any supposed interest in child pornography? 00:18:56 13 Α. Yes. 00:18:56 14 Q. There was an opportunity? 00:18:58 15 Α. Yes. And did he, in fact, discuss any interest in 00:18:58 16 Q. child pornography? 00:19:02 17 He denied interest in child pornography. 00:19:03 18 Α. there were a number of questions specifically addressing 00:19:07 19 00:19:13 20 interest in children as sex objects, interest in children -- arousal around children, arousal around 00:19:16 21 00:19:19 22 pictures of children, arousal around forms of sexual --00:19:26 23 of sexualized pictures with teenagers, young teenagers. 00:19:32 24 Q. And he denied any interest in that? 25 He generally denied an interest in anything other 00:19:35 Α.

than people within about three or four years of his age. 00:19:40 1 So I want to return to the statement which he 00:19:48 2 allegedly signed at police headquarters. Do you recall 00:19:55 3 examining that statement? 00:19:59 4 5 Α. Yes. 00:20:01 00:20:03 Q. And do you recall discussing it with Alex? 6 7 Α. Yes. 00:20:05 And based on your interview with Alex, why would 00:20:09 8 Q. he sign such a statement? 00:20:15 Alex indicated -- I don't know that I can say 00:20:19 10 with absolute certainty, but Alex indicated that it was 00:20:26 11 00:20:30 12 a three- or four-hour interrogation. The officer was 00:20:37 13 angry, as Alex recalls it, and pushing hard. And then the officer stopped -- for three or four hours. 00:20:44 14 00:20:48 15 the officer stopped and started typing something up which Alex said seemed to be something which the officer 00:20:50 16 implied would stop the process, stop the interrogation 00:20:56 17 00:21:01 18 and stop the charges. There was a specific -- as Alex recalled it, the officer said to him, this letter is to 00:21:06 19 00:21:19 20 the prosecutor, and there's no reason to follow this further. 00:21:21 21

Q. And did Alex tell you if he believed him?

00:21:23

00:21:26

00:21:32

00:21:40

22

23

24

25

- A. Alex said that he believed him at the time. Well, he said the guy lied.
 - Q. Based on your interviews with Alex and your

```
review of the materials, what type of relationship does
00:21:44
        1
            Alex have with people in authority?
00:21:47
        2
                   At the time that this was going on -- Alex is
00:21:54
        3
               Α.
00:21:59
            generally not very independent; he tended to rely on
        4
            people in authority. He was somewhat emotionally
00:22:07
00:22:10
            dependent and tended to be compliant for the most part.
            He was not somebody particularly rebellious. He went
        7
00:22:14
            along with those in authority because for the most part,
00:22:21
        8
            he assumed that they were more knowledgeable than him.
00:22:25
                   All right. And did you discuss with him at all
00:22:30
       10
            his relationship with his father?
00:22:33
       11
00:22:35
       12
               Α.
                   Yes.
00:22:35
       13
                   And will you tell the jury how he described that
            relationship.
00:22:39
       14
00:22:57
       15
                   He thought that his father was supportive;
               Α.
            friendly; loving; disciplined, as in following a
00:22:59
       16
            structure; had no difficulty in confiding with his
00:23:03
       17
            parents. And he thought that they treated him in a fair
00:23:10
       18
            fashion that was similar to his brother and sister.
00:23:16
       19
00:23:19
       20
               Q.
                   All right. Thank you. Now, a few final
            questions. Doctor, you've been in practice how many
00:23:25
       21
00:23:31
       22
            years?
00:23:32
       23
               Α.
                    I've been licensed for 33 years.
00:23:34
       24
               Q.
                   And how many years have you testified in court?
       25
00:23:36
               Α.
                   Thirty-three years.
```

```
Thirty-three years. And have you testified only
00:23:37
        1
               Q.
            for the defense?
00:23:41
        2
               A. Actually, for the most part I only perform
00:23:44
        3
            evaluations -- for the most part, 80 or 90 percent of
00:23:48
        4
            the time, I only perform evaluations when I am court
00:23:53
        5
00:23:56
            ordered, court appointed, so I enter neutral.
            testified for both prosecution and defense, depending on
        7
00:23:59
            what my opinion is after that.
00:24:03
        8
                  And in the spirit of full disclosure, are you
00:24:06
               Q.
            being paid the today?
00:24:11
       10
               Α.
                   Yes. For my time here, yes.
00:24:12
       11
00:24:14
       12
                   And would that in any way influence your
00:24:18
       13
            opinions?
00:24:20
       14
               Α.
                   No.
00:24:21
       15
               Q. All right. I'm sorry to jump around, but I
            thought of one more thing. You testified a bit earlier
00:24:30
       16
            that Alex appears to be a bit compliant. Do you recall
00:24:34
       17
            saying that?
00:24:40
       18
00:24:40
       19
               Α.
                  Yes.
00:24:42
       20
               Q. Would an extension of that be that Alex tends to
            blame other people for his problems?
00:24:49
       21
00:24:53
       22
                   Well, at this point he is less trusting and more
00:24:56
       23
            angry and more blaming.
00:25:01
       24
                        MS. KELLEY: All right. Thank you. No more
00:25:03 25
            questions.
```

```
00:25:16
        1
                      WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., CROSS-EXAMINATION
00:25:16
        2
            BY MR. CRAWFORD:
00:25:17
        3
00:25:17
                    Dr. Graves, you made a report of your evaluation
        4
               Q.
            of Mr. Cook; is that correct?
00:25:21
00:25:22
               Α.
                   That's correct.
        6
               Q. It's dated June 22, 2011?
        7
00:25:22
00:25:25
        8
               Α.
                   Yes.
                   Has your opinion changed at all today since you
00:25:25
        9
               Q.
            wrote that report in June?
00:25:29
       10
               Α.
                   No.
00:25:30
       11
               Q. Okay. And is it fair to say that the gist of
00:25:30
00:25:34
       13
            your analysis was that Mr. Cook may say untrue things to
            end an interrogation or a lengthy interview?
00:25:38
       14
00:25:40
                   He may say compliant things. He may say things
       15
            to get someone off his back. He may say things that are
00:25:44
            conceding just to end an interrogation, yes.
00:25:50
       17
00:25:55
       18
               Q. Untrue things?
                         THE COURT: The last part of your answer?
00:25:57
       19
       20
00:25:58
            I'm sorry. I didn't hear the last part of your answer.
00:26:02
       21
                         THE WITNESS: Conceding things in order to
00:26:04
       22
            end an interrogation.
00:26:06
       23
               Q. So your testimony is nonetheless he would be
            truthful in that situation?
00:26:08
       24
       25
               A. No, I didn't say that. He would say anything
00:26:10
```

```
that would end an interrogation if there was enough
00:26:12
        1
            pressure or intensity to it.
00:26:16
        2
00:26:18
                   So it might be untrue things?
        3
               Q.
00:26:20
                    It might be an untrue thing.
        4
               Α.
                   And you met with him on a couple of occasions?
00:26:21
        5
               Q.
00:26:24
               Α.
                   Yes.
        6
                   Was your interview with him confrontational?
        7
00:26:25
               Q.
                    It was about several subjects, yes.
00:26:27
        8
               Α.
                    And were you confident that he was telling you
00:26:29
               Q.
            the truth during those times?
00:26:34
       10
                    I was confident that he was truthful for the most
00:26:35
       11
00:26:42
       12
            part in the testing that I did because there are some
00:26:46
       13
            ways for me to evaluate that. I was -- I believe that
            he was withholding some information and downplaying some
00:26:51
       14
            aspects of his sexual life because he was still
00:26:56
       15
            embarrassed somewhat about psychosexual issues;
00:27:03
       16
            masturbation, for instance.
00:27:07
       17
                    At the beginning of the process you asked him to
00:27:09
       18
               Ο.
            sign a waiver of confidentiality, didn't you?
00:27:12
       19
00:27:15
       20
               Α.
                    I asked him to sign a waiver of confidentiality
            to his attorney and a -- an explanation that this
00:27:18
       21
00:27:23
       22
            information might end up in court, yes.
00:27:25
       23
                    And he signed an acknowledgment that this had
00:27:29
       24
            been explained to him by you?
       25
               Α.
                    Yes.
00:27:30
```

```
And that he knew his report would go to his
00:27:31
         1
                Q.
            federal public defender?
00:27:34
         2
                Α.
                    Yes.
00:27:36
         3
00:27:36
                    And who may or may not use that material in the
         4
                Ο.
            report as part of his defense?
00:27:38
         5
00:27:40
                Α.
                    Yes.
         6
        7
                Q.
                    You explained that to him, correct?
00:27:40
                    Several times.
00:27:43
         8
                Α.
                    Did you believe he understood you?
00:27:44
         9
                Q.
                    I thought he understood that I was not going to
00:27:46
        10
                Α.
            keep secrets and that the information was going to go to
00:27:49
        11
00:27:53
        12
            his defender and might go to the Court.
00:27:55
        13
                Q.
                    And you continued your evaluation anyway,
            correct?
00:27:58
        14
                    I did.
00:27:58
        15
                Α.
                    And you concluded in your report that you
00:28:06
       16
                Q.
            determined Mr. Cook was capable of understanding any
00:28:11
        17
            potential consequences of trial in this case?
00:28:14
       18
                    I thought that he seemed to understand the basics
00:28:18
        19
00:28:23
        20
            of trial and the consequences of generally having some
            significant punishment attached to being found guilty.
00:28:29
        21
00:28:39
        22
                    And you determined his level of performance; you
00:28:42
        23
            judged it to be adequate to answer computer
00:28:44
        24
            administrative test protocols?
        25
                Α.
                    Yes.
00:28:47
```

```
So that means you could set him down in front of
00:28:47
        1
               Q.
            a computer and have him answer questions?
00:28:49
        2
               A. His reading level was at the -- barely at the
00:28:51
        3
            minimum level required, fifth grade reading level, sixth
00:28:55
        4
            grade reading level.
00:29:00
00:29:01
                    Dr. Graves, you could sit him down in front of a
        6
            computer and ask him to answer questions; is that true?
        7
00:29:05
                    Well, I'm trying to answer that in terms of the
00:29:07
        8
               Α.
            reading level required, which is fifth grade reading
00:29:10
        9
            level. Yes.
00:29:14
       10
00:29:15
               Q. You also sent paperwork home with him. Is that
       11
00:29:18
       12
            true?
00:29:18
       13
               Α.
                   That's true.
               Q. And he returned that to you?
00:29:19
       14
00:29:20
       15
               Α.
                   He did.
                   And you used it in your report?
00:29:21
       16
               Q.
                   I did.
00:29:23
       17
               Α.
                    All right. You also discussed with Mr. Cook and
00:29:29
       18
               0.
            he provided you information concerning his computer
00:29:32
       19
00:29:34
       20
            usage; is that true?
00:29:35
       21
               Α.
                    Yes.
00:29:36
       22
                    And he admitted to you that he used LimeWire; is
00:29:41
       23
            that correct?
                  That's correct.
00:29:41
       24
               Α.
       25
               Q. And he admitted to downloading music using
00:29:41
```

```
1
            LimeWire?
00:29:46
        2
               Α.
                    Yes.
00:29:46
                   And he admitted he viewed adult pornography?
00:29:47
        3
                Q.
00:29:51
               Α.
                    Yes.
         4
                    And he admitted he used LimeWire to download
00:29:51
        5
                Ο.
00:29:54
            adult pornography; isn't that true?
                    I'd have to go back and look, but I think so.
        7
                Α.
00:29:57
                    Yes, he did.
00:30:12
        8
                    And he, in fact, admitted to you that he saw on
00:30:12
        9
                Q.
            his computer child pornography; isn't that true?
00:30:15
        10
                         MS. KELLEY: Excuse me. I couldn't hear
00:30:18
        11
00:30:20
        12
            that last phrase.
00:30:21
        13
                Q.
                    He admitted to you that he saw child pornography
            on his computer; is that correct?
00:30:24
        14
00:30:25
       15
                    He said a couple images of child pornography
                Α.
            popped up when he first turned his computer on, yes.
00:30:27
                    And he indicated he deleted them; is that true?
               Q.
00:30:30
       17
                    That's what he said.
00:30:33
       18
                Α.
                    And he provided a description of the girl who was
00:30:33
       19
                Q.
00:30:37
        20
            in the child pornography?
                    He did.
00:30:37
        21
               Α.
00:30:38
        22
                    That was 14 or 15 years old with breasts and no
00:30:42
        23
            body hair; is that true?
00:30:43
       24
               Α.
                    Yes. Small breasts, no body hair.
                Q. He gave you a description of his interview with
00:30:51
       25
```

```
FBI Agent Pape?
00:30:53
         1
         2
                Α.
                    He did.
00:30:54
                Q.
                    And in that interview he told you that Special
00:30:54
         3
            Agent Pape sat there yelling at me calling me an idiot
00:30:58
         4
            for three or four hours?
00:31:01
00:31:03
                Α.
                    Yes.
         6
        7
                Q.
                    And he also said to you he had no clue what it
00:31:04
            was about?
00:31:07
        8
00:31:08
                Α.
                    That's what he said.
                    And he told you that the statement that Special
00:31:08
        10
                Q.
            Agent Pape prepared was a letter to the prosecutor that
00:31:11
       11
            there is no reason to follow this further?
00:31:14
       12
                   That's what he said.
00:31:16
       13
                Α.
                    All right. And Mr. Cook also talked to you about
00:31:18
        14
                Ο.
00:31:21
        15
            his roommate. Is that true?
00:31:23
                    Yes.
       16
                Α.
                    And he indicated that he mistrusts his roommate?
00:31:28
       17
                Q.
                    He does now.
00:31:32
       18
                Α.
                    He indicated that his roommate wrecked his
00:31:32
       19
                Q.
00:31:35
       20
            four-wheeler and didn't repay him?
                Α.
00:31:37
        21
                    Yes.
00:31:38
        22
                    His roommate stuck him with a $350 cable bill for
00:31:42
       23
            the apartment?
00:31:42
       24
                Α.
                   Yes.
       25
                Q. The roommate never helped him pay for it?
00:31:43
```

```
00:31:46
        1
               Α.
                    Yes.
                Q. He indicated, referring to himself, "I was
00:31:46
        2
            stupid. He's a jerk"? It's page 6 of the record, the
00:31:48
        3
00:32:01
            first full paragraph.
        4
               Α.
00:32:07
                    Yes.
00:32:09
                Q. And you indicated apparently there were other
        7
            bills he was forced to pay because the roommate, quote,
00:32:11
            swears he paid it?
00:32:15
        8
00:32:17
               Α.
                    Yes.
        9
                    And Mr. Cook described his roommate as having no
00:32:17
        10
                Ο.
            job, being lazy, yet he called Mr. Cook lazy. Is that
00:32:21
       11
00:32:25
       12
            true?
00:32:27
       13
               Α.
                    Yes.
                   He also made statements about the FBI in this
00:32:29
       14
                0.
00:32:31
        15
            case; isn't that true?
00:32:34
       16
               Α.
                   Yes.
                   He said that he trusted the FBI?
00:32:35
       17
                Q.
00:32:39
       18
               Α.
                    He did say that.
                    And he trusted the FBI not to mess me over, and
00:32:41
        19
                Q.
00:32:43
       20
            they all lied to me. Isn't that true?
                    That was his statement.
00:32:45
        21
                Α.
00:32:46
        22
                    He said, I was helpful in any way I could be to
                Q.
00:32:49
       23
            them because I had nothing to hide. He said that,
            didn't he?
00:32:52
       24
00:32:53 25
               A. Yes.
```

```
And he said, "When I found out other things they
00:32:53
        1
               Q.
            forgot to look at, I called them, asked them if they
00:32:56
        2
            wanted to come and get them." He said that?
00:32:59
        3
                    That's what he said.
00:33:00
               Α.
        4
                   And he said, "I signed a waiver for them to
00:33:01
        5
               Ο.
00:33:04
            search my vehicle"?
        7
               Α.
                  Yes.
00:33:05
                    "I was trying to be helpful, and they messed me
00:33:05
               Q.
        8
            over." Did he say that?
00:33:08
        9
               A. He did say that.
00:33:09
       10
               Q. Did he indicate that he's angry with this
00:33:10
       11
00:33:13
       12
            process; called it ridiculous, unfair, uncalled for, and
00:33:17
       13
            one-sided"? Page 7, Dr. Graves. Second full
00:33:38
       14
            paragraph.
00:33:39
       15
               Α.
                    Yes.
               Q. And he never indicated to you that he believed he
00:33:44
       16
            was a victim of identity theft?
00:33:48
       17
                   He did not.
00:33:51
       18
               Α.
                    And he never indicated to you that he thought his
00:33:51
       19
               Q.
00:33:53
       20
            roommate had downloaded child pornography on his
            computer, did he?
00:33:57
       21
00:33:59
       22
               Α.
                   No.
00:34:16
       23
                         MR. CRAWFORD: No further questions, Judge.
00:34:18
       24
                         THE COURT: Redirect?
00:34:19 25
                         MS. KELLEY: Yes.
                                              Thank you.
```

```
00:34:20
        1
                    WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., REDIRECT EXAMINATION
00:34:20
        2
            BY MS. KELLEY:
00:34:21
        3
00:34:21
               Q. Sir, you authored this report in May of this
        4
            year, correct?
00:34:23
        5
               A. June of this year.
00:34:24
        6
        7
                  June of this year. Three, four months ago,
00:34:25
               Q.
            correct?
00:34:28
        8
               A. Yes.
00:34:28
        9
                   And if you remember, who was the attorney on the
00:34:28
       10
            case at that point?
00:34:36
       11
00:34:37
       12
               A. Attorney Donna Grill.
00:34:41
       13
               Q.
                   All right. Not Elizabeth Kelley?
00:34:43
       14
               Α.
                   No.
00:34:47
                   Now, what grade reading level did Alex perform
       15
               Q.
            at?
00:34:54
       16
               A. His reading level was at a seventh grade
00:34:56
       17
            equivalent, which is a 14th percentile. His spelling
       18
00:34:58
            was at a fifth percentile, fifth grade level.
00:35:03
       19
00:35:08
       20
               Q. All right. And recalling your attention again to
            the supposed confession which he signed, given the
00:35:15
       21
       22
            circumstances at the FBI office that morning, would Alex
00:35:20
00:35:26
       23
            have been able to have fully comprehended what he was
00:35:30
       24
            reading if, in fact, he could read it?
       25
                         MR. SECOR: Objection, Your Honor. There's
00:35:36
```

```
been no testimony that he knew what the circumstances
00:35:38
        1
            were that morning of the confession.
00:35:40
        2
00:35:45
                         MS. KELLEY: Well --
        3
00:35:47
                         THE COURT: Why don't you lay those
        4
            circumstances out.
00:35:49
        5
00:35:50
        6
                         MS. KELLEY: All right.
            BY MS. KELLEY:
        7
00:35:51
                   Describe for the jury then the circumstances
00:35:51
        8
               Q.
            under which you understood Alex to have reviewed that
00:35:54
            confession that morning?
00:36:00
               A. He was called in for an interview by the Special
00:36:03
       11
00:36:10
       12
            Agent. It was the first time that he had been in any
00:36:13
       13
            kind of serious trouble. He said the interrogation --
            "interrogation" was his word -- went on for three or
00:36:21
       14
00:36:23
       15
            four hours. And the agent was yelling at him, calling
            him stupid. There were several derogatory statements
00:36:27
       16
            about it. And that it went on for a significant period
00:36:37
       17
            of time. And in that atmosphere when it suddenly seemed
00:36:40
       18
            to let up, and the agent was typing something, Alex felt
00:36:46
       19
00:36:51
       20
            a sense of relief and wanting to get out of there.
                   Why did he feel a sense of relief?
00:36:55
       21
               Ο.
00:36:57
       22
                   Well, that the intense, angry interrogation had
00:37:02
       23
            stopped.
00:37:04
       24
               Q. All right.
       25
                         MS. KELLEY: Is that a sufficient
00:37:06
```

```
foundation, Your Honor, to pursue --
00:37:07
        1
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Your Honor, the objection
00:37:10
        2
            still stands. This is all based upon --
00:37:11
        3
00:37:14
                         THE COURT: Approach.
        4
                         (Whereupon the following discussion was had
00:37:16
        5
00:38:30
            at the bench outside the hearing of the jury:)
        6
        7
                         THE COURT: Your objection?
00:38:30
                         MR. SECOR: My objection is all this is
00:38:30
        8
            based upon the defendant's self-reporting. He's not
00:38:30
        9
            making an opinion based on what actually happened or
00:38:30
       10
            what the government contends happens. On a self-report
00:38:30
       11
00:38:30
       12
            here.
00:38:30
       13
                         THE COURT: I understand. But I assume that
            defendant will testify to that fact, and based upon his
00:38:32
       14
00:38:32
       15
            understanding as communicated by the defendant, and you
            can dispute that and you can ask on cross-examination,
00:38:32
       16
            well, what if these were the facts?
00:38:32
       17
00:38:32
       18
                         MR. SECOR: All right.
                         MS. KELLEY: I'm confused. I thought this
00:38:32
       19
00:38:33
       20
            was Mr. Crawford's witness.
                         MR. CRAWFORD: We'll be mindful of that.
00:38:33
       21
00:38:33
       22
                         (End of sidebar discussion.)
00:38:33
       23
                         THE COURT: You may continue.
00:38:35
       24
                         MS. KELLEY: Thank you, Your Honor.
       25
            BY MS. KELLEY:
00:38:37
```

```
Doctor, based on your interviews with Alex and
00:38:38
        1
               Q.
            your reviews of the materials, do you have an opinion as
00:38:42
        2
            to why Alex would sign such a statement?
00:38:49
        3
00:38:51
               Α.
                    Yes.
        4
                    And please tell the jury that opinion?
00:38:51
        5
               Q.
00:38:55
               Α.
                    Because he doesn't trust his own ability to
        6
        7
            understand documents very well, because he is passive
00:39:00
            and somewhat conflict-avoidant with adults, and because
00:39:05
        8
            he wanted to escape from the interrogation situation and
00:39:11
            thought that's what he was being offered if he signed.
00:39:14
       10
                         MS. KELLEY: All right. Thank you.
00:39:20
       11
00:39:22
       12
            further questions.
00:39:42
       13
                     WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., RECROSS-EXAMINATION
00:39:42
       14
00:39:43
       15
            BY MR. CRAWFORD:
                    Dr. Graves, Mr. Cook's statement that he was
00:39:43
       16
               0.
            being interrogated for three or four hours while an
00:39:47
       17
            agent was yelling at him calling him an idiot, that
00:39:49
       18
            factored in your determination in your evaluation of Mr.
00:39:53
       19
00:39:57
       20
            Cook, didn't it?
00:39:58
       21
               Α.
                    Yes.
00:39:58
       22
                    And had that circumstance about the interrogation
00:40:02
       23
            been untrue, that would have changed your opinion?
00:40:06
       24
               Α.
                    It might have.
```

Q. And had Mr. Cook voluntarily went down to the FBI

25

00:40:08

```
office, had not been detained, not been arrested, and
00:40:17
        1
            not been in an interrogation, could that have changed
00:40:20
        2
            your opinion and your evaluation of Mr. Cook?
00:40:24
        3
00:40:30
                    I guess it depends on -- again, this is -- Mr.
        4
            Cook's subjective view of his experience is more
00:40:34
        5
00:40:39
            important than the practical elements of it. However,
        7
            if he -- if it was less than three or four hours by a
00:40:44
            significant margin, if there wasn't as much yelling as
00:40:48
        8
            he proposes, those would have been important.
00:40:51
        9
00:40:55
       10
                   And his subjective evaluation as you understand
            it is based entirely on his self-reporting to you?
00:40:58
       11
                    That's what I had available.
00:41:00
       12
               A.
00:41:05
       1.3
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Thank you.
00:41:08
       14
00:41:08
       15
                WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION
            BY MS. KELLEY:
00:41:12
       16
                    Just one question. Subjective often means
00:41:12
       17
               Q.
            self-reporting, doesn't it?
00:41:15
       18
00:41:17
       19
               Α.
                   Yes.
00:41:18
       20
                         MS. KELLEY: Thank you. No more questions.
00:41:20
       21
                         THE COURT: You may step down. You're free
00:41:21
       22
            to go or welcome to stay; it's entirely up to you.
00:41:35
       23
                         Are you ready to resume with the prosecution
00:41:37
       24
            case?
       25
                        MR. CRAWFORD: We are, Your Honor. We would
00:41:37
```

```
call Detective David Morford.
00:41:39
        1
        2
                         MS. KELLEY: Excuse me, Your Honor. Could
00:41:42
            we have a brief recess?
00:41:44
        3
00:41:45
                         THE COURT: Sure. About five minutes or so?
        4
                         Ladies and gentlemen, if you want to step
00:41:51
        5
            out for a moment, that's fine.
00:41:53
        6
        7
                         (Recess taken.)
00:51:22
                         THE COURT: Ready to resume?
00:51:25
        8
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Our next witness IS Detective
00:51:27
        9
            David Morford of the Toledo Police Department.
00:51:29
       10
                         THE COURT: What are we going to hear?
00:51:31
       11
00:51:33
       12
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Detective Morford conducted a
00:51:37
       13
            forensic analysis of the computer sized from the
00:51:40
       14
            Knollwood apartment.
00:51:42
       15
                         (The witness was sworn by the clerk.)
                         THE COURT: Good afternoon. Have a seat.
00:51:51
       16
            Tell the ladies and gentlemen your name, please.
00:51:54
       17
00:51:55
                         THE DEFENDANT: David Morford,
       18
            M-o-r-f-o-r-d.
00:51:57
       19
00:52:00
       20
                         THE COURT: Maybe a little closer. Not too
            much closer.
00:52:03
       21
       22
                         THE WITNESS: David Morford, M-o-r-f-o-r-d.
00:52:14
00:52:17
       23
                         THE COURT: Can you hear okay, ladies and
00:52:19
      24
            gentlemen?
       25
                         And what is your occupation or profession?
00:52:20
```

```
THE WITNESS: I'm a detective with the
00:52:24
        1
00:52:25
            Toledo Police Department.
        2
00:52:26
                         THE COURT: How long have you been with the
        3
00:52:28
            TPD?
        4
        5
00:52:29
                         THE WITNESS: Seventeen years.
00:52:30
                         THE COURT: And how long have you held the
        6
        7
            rank of detective?
00:52:32
00:52:33
        8
                         THE WITNESS: Six years.
                         THE COURT: And what do you do presently?
00:52:34
        9
                         THE WITNESS: I'm in the computer crimes
00:52:36
       10
            unit, mainly computer forensics.
00:52:38
       11
00:52:41
       12
                         THE COURT: How long have you been doing
            that sort of work?
00:52:42
       1.3
00:52:43
       14
                         THE WITNESS: Six years.
00:52:44
       15
                         THE COURT: What sort of training or
            preparation did you have for it?
00:52:45
                         THE WITNESS: I've been to several
       17
00:52:46
00:52:49
       18
            trainings: Basic data recovery and acquisition; network
            intrusive response for the Secret Service; Access Data
00:52:55
       19
00:52:58
       20
            boot camp, which is the software that we use for
            forensics; practical examiner test for Access Data;
00:53:01
       21
00:53:05
       22
            advanced forensics, basic computer recovery and evidence
00:53:12
       23
            response. I'm an ICAC or InCAC instructor.
00:53:19
       2.4
                         THE COURT: What does that stand for?
      25
00:53:20
                         THE WITNESS: Internet Crimes Against
```

```
Children.
00:53:21
        1
        2
                         THE COURT: Instructor where?
00:53:22
                         THE WITNESS: For their ICAC program,
00:53:26
        3
            conducting online investigations with things such as
00:53:28
        4
            Facebook and My Space.
00:53:32
        5
                         THE COURT: Is that here in Toledo or
00:53:33
        6
        7
            elsewhere?
00:53:35
                         THE WITNESS: It's nationwide.
00:53:36
        8
                         THE COURT: I meant the instruction; where
00:53:38
        9
            do you do that?
00:53:39
       10
                         THE WITNESS: We don't have enough people
00:53:40
       11
       12
           here that can do it.
00:53:42
00:53:47
       13
                         THE COURT: Mr. Crawford, continue.
00:53:50
       14
00:53:50
       15
                         DAVID MORFORD, DIRECT EXAMINATION
            BY MR. CRAWFORD:
00:53:51
       16
               Q. Mr. Morford, I'm handing you what's been
00:53:51
       17
            identified as Government's Exhibit 7. Do you recognize
       18
00:53:55
            that item?
00:53:58
       19
00:53:58
       20
               A. I do.
00:53:59
       21
               Q. How do you recognize that?
       22
                    It's just a bag that was brought to me, that was
00:54:00
       23
            brought to me along with the rest of the items in the
00:54:04
00:54:07
       24
            case. It was sealed when I got it.
       25
               Q. Can you describe the condition it was in the bag
00:54:08
```

```
when you?
00:54:11
        1
                    This was sealed, and I would have cut it to open
00:54:11
        2
            it so I could get to the laptop inside.
00:54:15
        3
00:54:18
                  At the time you received it, did it appear to
        4
               Ο.
            have been opened and resealed several times or --
00:54:21
00:54:23
               Α.
                    No.
        6
        7
               Q.
                   Just one seal?
00:54:23
               A. I think I broke the seal, the original seal.
00:54:25
        8
00:54:28
                   And what did you find inside there?
        9
               Q.
                    There's a laptop, an HP; the battery is out.
00:54:30
       10
               Α.
            And a power cord.
00:54:37
       11
00:54:38
       12
               Q.
                    Can you remove those items from the bag, please.
00:54:52
       13
                    To your recollection are the items that are
            before you today the items that were in that bag when
00:54:54
       14
            you first received it?
00:54:57
       15
                    Yes.
00:54:59
       16
               Α.
                   And at the time you first received that computer,
00:55:01
       17
            did you -- could you just generally describe what
00:55:09
       18
            condition it was in?
00:55:11
       19
00:55:12
       20
               A. Exactly this condition. The battery was out,
            power cable was separate, exactly like it is now.
00:55:15
       21
00:55:19
       22
                  Was there any indication that it had been
00:55:21
       23
            tampered with, damaged, that you could tell?
00:55:24
       24
               Α.
                    No. It's in pretty good shape.
               Q. Perhaps I asked you this, but does it appear
00:55:28
       25
```

```
today as it did when you first opened the bag to examine
00:55:31
        1
            it?
00:55:35
        2
                   Yes, it does.
00:55:35
        3
               Α.
00:55:38
                   Could you please describe briefly for the jury
        4
               Q.
            the capabilities of a computer. Is a computer able to
00:55:41
00:55:45
            store information?
        7
                   Absolutely.
00:55:45
               Α.
                   How does it do that?
00:55:46
               Q.
        8
                    Computers have hard drives inside of them.
00:55:47
               Α.
            a piece of media that stores data, the operating system,
00:55:52
       10
            files, whatever you choose to put on there.
00:55:54
       11
                   And what sort of files could these be?
00:55:56
       12
               Q.
00:56:00
       13
                   Anything; documents, pictures, movies,
            spreadsheets, e-mail.
00:56:03
       14
                    You said they're stored on a hard drive. Could
00:56:05
       15
               Q.
            you describe what physically a hard drive looks like?
00:56:08
                   A hard drive is -- in this particular laptop it's
00:56:11
       17
               Α.
            a small square, probably four inches by five and a half
00:56:15
       18
            inches, maybe three-quarters of an inch thick. There's
00:56:21
       19
00:56:25
       20
            platters inside that the media is stored on. And those
            platters spin, if it's a normal hard drive. There are
00:56:29
       21
00:56:32
       22
            SD drives that have no moving parts; it just stores data
00:56:36
       23
            in sectors on the drive.
00:56:37
       24
               Q. The computer can store and retrieve data from
       25
            this hard drive?
00:56:40
```

- 1 Α. Yes.
 - If you want to know what's contained on that hard 2 drive, what do you have to do? 3
 - A. What we do is image the hard drive. We pull the original hard drive out of the machine; we log the drive serial number and the type, and then we make a duplicate sector by sector, bit by bit of the original, and then we analyze the copy. We put the original back in the original machine, and we don't touch it again.
 - Why do you do that as opposed to just, say, turn on the computer and look around to see what's there?
 - For several reasons. The first reason is if you Α. do your work off of an image, you don't have to worry about disturbing the original media, changing anything on it, even inadvertently. We image through a write blocker so there's no chance of us writing to that drive. So the image we make is as the drive was when we pull it out.

The second reason that we work off an image is because like any piece of equipment, it can break. And you want to touch the drive as little as possible so you don't have a failure and have the drive then be inoperable for whatever reason.

- Q. Did that computer have a hard drive in it?
- Α. Yes.

- 00:56:41
- 00:56:42
- 00:56:44
- 00:56:47 4
- 00:56:50
- 00:56:54
- 7 00:56:57
- 00:57:02 8
- 00:57:07
- 00:57:09
- 00:57:12 11
- 00:57:14 12
- 00:57:17 13
- 00:57:20 14
- 00:57:23 15
- 00:57:28 16
- 00:57:31 17
- 00:57:34 18
- 00:57:35 19
- 00:57:38 20
- 00:57:41 21
- 00:57:44 22
- 00:57:46 23
- 00:57:48 24
- 25 00:57:50

```
And did you make an effort to make an image of
00:57:50
        1
               Q.
            that part of it?
00:57:53
        2
               Α.
                   I did.
00:57:53
        3
00:57:54
               Q. Please describe that process.
        4
               A. We plug the original drive into -- we have a
00:57:55
        5
00:58:01
            machine called a FRED, which in essence is a big
        7
            computer.
00:58:05
               Q. Could you step back even farther. You have the
00:58:05
        8
            computer in front of you. You want to make an image.
00:58:08
            What do you do?
00:58:10
       10
               A. The first thing I do is log the computer serial
00:58:11
       11
00:58:14
       12
            number. If there's any damage on the computer at that
00:58:16
       13
            time or anything that stands out, I would note that,
            that the machine looks operable.
00:58:18
       14
                   I then remove the hard drive. It's usually on a
00:58:21
       15
            panel under the bottom of the laptop held by a couple
00:58:24
       16
            screws. Remove the hard drive; I log the hard drive's
00:58:27
       17
            information for my supplemental. Then I take the hard
00:58:29
       18
            drive, the original, and I plug it into a write blocker
00:58:33
       19
00:58:37
       20
            on our FRED, which stands for Forensic Recovery of
            Evidence Device. It's just a big computer. We plug it
00:58:44
       21
```

into a write blocker so we can access the drive but we

cannot make changes to the drive; we can't write to it

in any way. We then use some software called Access

00:58:58 25 Data Imager to make a duplicate of the drive.

00:58:49

00:58:51

00:58:55

22

23

24

```
0:59:06 1 Q. And when you make this duplicate, what's the end 0:59:09 2 product?
```

A. The end product is a series of image files that are 1500 megs in size each until the entire drive from beginning to end is written. The image it writes from the very first bit in the very first sector on the drive to the very end of the drive, the very last bit, very last sector, all of the deleted space, the free space, every part of the drive is imaged.

Then it's hashed, which in essence is an algorithm thrown against the original drive, is a mathematical algorithm which spits back a result that's called a hash value. Then our image is hashed. And the image should be -- in this case it was identical.

- Q. Could you explain a little more what a hash value is, how it's derived and what it tells you about a particular computer file?
- A. It is a mathematical algorithm that is thrown at the hard drive.
 - Q. What do you mean, "thrown at"?
- A. It is applied to the drive as the data sits. And it gives a response, which is a string of -- a very long string of numbers and letters. It's unique to that drive as the data on that drive sits. If you were to change any data on the drive at all, the algorithm, the

- 00:59:06 00:59:09 00:59:10 3 00:59:13 4 00:59:18 00:59:22 7 00:59:25 00:59:29 8 00:59:33 00:59:36 10 11 00:59:41 00:59:43 12 00:59:47 13 00:59:51 14 00:59:54 15 00:59:57 16
- 01:00:00 17 01:00:01 18 01:00:05 19 01:00:05 20 01:00:07 21 01:00:10 22 01:00:15 23 01:00:18 24

01:00:21

```
response will change. That's the hash value.
01:00:24
        1
01:00:27
        2
            similar to a DNA strand for the -- that would be how I
01:00:31
            would equate it. And then the hash is also applied to
        3
            our image as it sits to make sure that it's identical.
01:00:36
        4
01:00:40
                   Okay. You indicated in this case the hash value
               0.
01:00:45
            from the computer in front of you was the same as the
            image. What does that tell you about the image?
01:00:47
        7
                   When I was trained on hash values I was told that
01:00:49
        8
               Α.
01:00:53
            the chances of two separate hard drives, two different
            hard drives having identical hash values is less than
01:00:56
       10
01:01:00
       11
            one in 490 quadrillion. So it tells me it's an
            identical copy I'm looking at (.
01:01:06
       12
01:01:10
       13
               Q.
                   Once you made this image, were you able to
            examine or view this image in a virtual environment?
01:01:13
       14
01:01:17
       15
               Α.
                   I was.
01:01:18
                   Could you just describe, please, how that process
       16
               Q.
            works?
01:01:21
       17
                   I used a piece of software called Virtual Box.
01:01:21
       18
               Α.
            It is a piece of software that runs within my computer,
01:01:26
       19
            like any other piece of software. Within Virtual Box I
01:01:30
       20
            can take my image and I can mount it as if it were a
01:01:33
       21
01:01:37
       22
            hard drive on my machine virtually. I can then have
01:01:43
       23
            Virtual Box boot that image as if I were sitting in
01:01:46
       24
            front of the laptop myself, booting the machine up on
       25
            the actual machine. Everything is virtualized; the
01:01:51
```

```
video card, everything within Virtual Box is a virtual
01:01:54
        1
01:01:58
            environment. It doesn't touch my host. It's just a
        2
01:02:01
            piece of software running on my machine.
        3
01:02:05
               Q. So you're basically able to take the image and
        4
            view that computer as if you had turned the computer on
01:02:07
01:02:10
            in front of you?
        7
               Α.
                   Correct.
01:02:10
                   And when you took a look at this image, what sort
01:02:11
        8
               Q.
01:02:17
            of steps did you have to take to eventually access the
        9
01:02:20
       10
            computer?
               Α.
                   When I first booted the machine up, there were --
01:02:20
       11
01:02:25
       12
            there's an account on the machine, a login account which
01:02:29
       13
            most newer windows machines have; it's password
            protected. The only other way onto the machine -- there
01:02:32
       14
01:02:35
       15
            were two ways of access, the logon password, which I
            didn't have; or biometric, which is fingerprint reader.
01:02:39
       16
            We used a piece of software called Paragon Rescue Disk,
01:02:44
       17
01:02:48
       18
            which we can put between the boot process -- we can boot
01:02:52
       19
            from a CD to Paragon, access the registry and wipe the
01:02:57
       20
            password so that we can boot into the machine.
            that's what happened.
01:03:00
       21
01:03:01
       22
                   Now, the fact that your image was password
01:03:03
       23
            protected, what does that tell you about the laptop in
01:03:06
       24
            front of you?
```

A. There's a login password or a biometric reader to

25

01:03:07

```
get on to it.
01:03:10
        1
                    So someone turning on that computer today would
01:03:11
        2
            need a password to access the computer?
01:03:13
        3
01:03:15
               Α.
                  Correct.
        4
                   Let me show you this, what's marked as
01:03:16
        5
               Ο.
01:03:19
            Government's Exhibit 15. Do you recognize this image?
        7
                   Yes, I do.
01:03:48
               Α.
                   What is it?
01:03:49
        8
               Q.
01:03:50
                    That's the desktop within Virtual Box of the
        9
               Α.
01:03:54
       10
            image from this laptop.
01:03:56
               Q. Okay. And up here in the top left corner, what
       11
            does that mean?
01:04:06
       12
01:04:06
       13
               A. That's showing that I'm running Virtual Box, I'm
            running a piece of software within my host. And when I
01:04:10
       14
01:04:14
       15
            started up this virtual machine, I named it Cook so I
            knew what I was looking at because that's the case I was
01:04:17
       16
            working on.
01:04:20
       17
               Q. The computer in front of you, if you were to plug
01:04:20
       18
            that computer in and turn it on, enter the appropriate
01:04:23
       19
01:04:26
       20
            password, what would be the computer screen that you
            would see?
01:04:29
       21
01:04:30
       22
               A. You wouldn't see this blue outline. You would
01:04:34
       23
            see the login screen, and once you got by it, you would
01:04:37
       24
            see this desktop.
```

Q. What do you mean by this desktop?

25

01:04:38

```
This is what you would see on the screen, all
01:04:40
        1
               Α.
            these icons, this fire wallpaper, or whatever that
01:04:42
        2
            actually is.
01:04:46
        3
01:04:47
               Q. And this photograph that's on the desktop here?
         4
                    That, yes, that's what you'd see.
01:04:50
        5
               Α.
01:04:53
                    And after putting this image in the Virtual Box,
         6
        7
            what did you do?
01:04:59
                    The first thing that I made note of was there
01:05:00
        8
               Α.
01:05:04
            appeared to be file sharing software that's sitting on
            the desktop, the LimeWire, the version of LimeWire.
01:05:08
       10
            then opened up the My Computer.
01:05:12
       11
01:05:14
       12
               Q.
                    Is this what you're referring to?
01:05:16
       13
               Α.
                    Correct.
                    What is this?
01:05:17
       14
               Q.
01:05:17
       15
                    That's a file sharing program. It's very
               Α.
            popular. It was shut down by the federal government, I
01:05:21
       16
            believe, in January.
01:05:24
       17
                   And what does this icon on the desktop represent?
01:05:25
       18
               Ο.
               Α.
01:05:31
       19
                    That's a shortcut to run the program.
01:05:33
       20
               Q.
                   5.3.6; what is that?
                    That's the version of the software that's on
01:05:36
       21
               Α.
01:05:39
       22
            there.
01:05:47
       23
               Q.
                    Okay. What's this image?
                    This is the documents folder under the account
01:05:49
       24
               Α.
       25
            name "Alex" on this machine.
01:05:52
```

- What do you mean by account name "Alex"? 1 Q.
 - The account name, when I originally booted the machine in Virtual Box, was Alex. So that's the name of the account that you are logging into or accessing when you go into the machine.
 - Q. Okay. Then over on the left-hand side here, desktop, there's Alex, then what are these items underneath?
 - That's the file free under that account; Α. contacts; the desktop, which will show you the icons on the desktop; the documents, which is what we were in. There's a downloads folder, favorites links, music; your iTunes can go in there.
 - Then on the right-hand side of the screen, what Ο. are those items?
 - That's going to be the contents of the documents folder.
 - Q. Are those user created files or system files?
 - The bottom seven are going to be documents. The text documents were probably created with Word Pad, and the Word documents obviously were created with Microsoft Word.
 - 0. Are those documents that are automatically created by windows, or are those documents that a user would have to create?

- 01:05:57
- 01:06:02 3

2

01:05:59

- 01:06:06 4
- 01:06:10
- 01:06:12
- 7 01:06:20
- 01:06:23 8
- 01:06:23
- 01:06:25
- 01:06:29 11
- 01:06:32 12
- 01:06:37 13
- 01:06:42 14
- 01:06:47 15
- 01:06:48 16
- 01:06:50 17
- 01:06:51 18
- 01:06:57 19
- 01:07:03 20
- 01:07:08 21
- 01:07:12 22
- 01:07:12 23
- 01:07:18 24
- 25 01:07:21

- Those are user-created files. 1 Α.
- What are the two folders at the top, LimeWire and 01:07:25 2 Q. webcam. 01:07:28 3
 - Α. LimeWire and webcam are files within this folder.
 - What's this screen? Ο.
 - Α. These are the contents of the LimeWire folder.
 - What is "incomplete"? Q.
 - Incomplete is a partial download. With LimeWire Α. when you initiate a download your download is written to the incomplete folder until it completes. Once the download is finished, it transfers to this saved folder or whatever folder has been designated as -- by the user.
 - And what is in the saved folder? Ο.
 - The saved folder in this particular case is going Α. to be a file library, movies, documents, music.
 - O. And where does the saved information -- where does the contents of the saved folder come from?
 - In this case they can be downloaded from LimeWire. They can be copied into that folder by the user.
 - What does "store purchased" mean? Q.
 - Α. Store purchased. LimeWire, they have an option very similar to iTunes where you can actually go and buy files.

- 01:07:23
- 01:07:30 4
- 01:07:39 5
- 01:07:41 6
- 7 01:07:51
- 01:07:52 8
- 01:07:57
- 01:08:01 10
- 01:08:04 11
- 01:08:07 12
- 01:08:11 13
- 01:08:11 14
- 01:08:13 15
- 01:08:16
- 01:08:21 17
- 01:08:23 18
- 01:08:25 19
- 01:08:32 20
- 01:08:35 21
- 01:08:36 22
- 01:08:39 23
- 01:08:43 24
- 25 01:08:47

- All right. And what is this screen? 01:09:12 1 Q.
- 01:09:17 A. This is going to be the contents of the LimeWire 2 saved folder. 01:09:20 3
 - Q. Okay. Briefly before we go on, any passwords required to use Windows Explorer and view these items once a person gets past the initial password?
 - A. No.
 - Q. Any special training required to view these files?
 - Just double click. Α.
 - Q. Any special computer program required to uncover some sort or hidden files in order to view these?
 - Α. No.
 - So here we have a blown up portion of the Ο. left-hand side of this slide. What does this represent again?
 - A. This is the file tree again showing where these particular files, these particular folders lie within the file path.
 - Q. All right. And on the left-hand side here -- on the right hand side, I'm sorry, what is that information?
 - This is going to be the contents of the actual LimeWire saved folder.
 - Q. All right. And just briefly describe what are

- 01:09:21 4
- 01:09:32
- 01:09:36
- 7 01:09:38
- 01:09:39 8
- 01:09:41 9
- 01:09:41 10
- 01:09:43 11
- 01:09:47 12
- 01:09:49 13
- 01:09:49 14
- 01:09:55 15
- 01:09:57 16
- 01:09:57 17
- 01:10:00 18
- 01:10:04 19
- 01:10:12 20
- 01:10:16 21
- 01:10:20 22
- 01:10:20 23
- 01:10:23 24
- 25 01:10:27

```
01:10:32
            some of the contents in the LimeWire saved folder on
        1
            this computer?
01:10:35
        2
               A. Well, the icons on the left side will tell you
01:10:36
        3
            what type of file it is. I see JPEGs, which are still
01:10:38
        4
            photos; music or audio files of some kind; and one movie
01:10:43
01:10:49
            of some kind.
               Q. And what is -- what are the music files?
        7
01:10:52
               A. The Forrest Gump soundtrack, that looks like a
01:10:55
        8
01:11:00
            song; Shaggie --
               Q. And you mentioned some images and videos.
01:11:04
       10
            there any file names here that are indicative to you of
01:11:07
       11
01:11:10
       12
            potentially containing child pornography?
01:11:14
       13
               Α.
                   Yes.
               Q. Could you just identify one please?
01:11:14
       14
01:11:17
       15
               Α.
                    Sure. Youth jailbait private daughter pussy PEDO
            Lolita PTHC.
01:11:25
       16
                   Could you identify what PTHC means?
01:11:28
       17
               Q.
                   Preteen hardcore.
01:11:31
       18
               Α.
                    In your investigations do you routinely come
01:11:32
       19
               Q.
01:11:35
       20
            across that term?
                    Yes. It's a common search term used to find
01:11:36
       21
               Α.
01:11:41
       22
            child pornography.
01:11:42
       23
                    In using LimeWire, how does one find files using
            LimeWire?
01:11:49
       24
      25
               A. With LimeWire you do a search by key words.
01:11:50
                                                                     You
```

```
can -- you'll see that a lot of these files have really
01:11:55
        1
            long file names, and that's for a reason, so that you
01:12:00
        2
01:12:02
            can hit on them with one key word. So you'd do a search
        3
            for whatever key word you're using, and for -- and I
01:12:07
        4
            can't tell you these files which key word was used, but,
01:12:10
01:12:14
            for example, PTHC, and you will then go out on the
            Gnutella network and look for files with PTHC in the
        7
01:12:18
            title.
01:12:21
        8
01:12:21
                   Down here in the lower left-hand corner you see
               Ο.
            870 items. What does that mean?
01:12:25
                   That's the total number of items within this
01:12:28
       11
            folder.
01:12:31
       12
               Q. And within which folder?
01:12:33
       1.3
               Α.
                   The LimeWire saved.
01:12:35
       14
                   What is this screen?
01:12:52
       15
               Q.
                   This is the same folder. I scrolled down just a
01:12:53
       16
               Α.
            little ways to take some random shots of it. Also shows
01:12:56
       17
            the contents of the folder, just farther down.
01:13:01
       18
                   You say this is the LimeWire saved folder?
01:13:04
       19
               Q.
01:13:06
       20
               Α.
                   It is.
                   And what is this?
01:13:15
       21
               Ο.
01:13:16
       22
                   The same, farther down on the same -- just a
               Α.
01:13:20
       23
            random shot of the contents of the saved folder.
01:13:29
       24
               Q. All right. What are some of the files, types of
       25
            files that are located here?
01:13:32
```

A. I see three audio files, and it looks like three 01:13:33 1 media files, movies. 01:13:38 2 Q. What are the audio files? 01:13:40 3 A. The top three, the Creed, Crossfade and Crystal 01:13:41 4 01:13:45 Shawanda. 01:13:49 Q. Are any of the other files indicative of child 7 pornography? 01:13:55 A. Cute 12 year old being taught by daddy, fisting, 01:13:55 8 01:14:00 incest, child. Q. What is this screen? It looks different. Please 01:14:14 01:14:18 explain the difference between this screen and the last 11 01:14:21 12 screen. 01:14:21 13 A. This is the LimeWire library within the LimeWire software. So I started the LimeWire software and 01:14:24 14 actually viewed the library within the software. 01:14:27 15 Q. Okay. So we saw the LimeWire icon on the 01:14:32 16 desktop, one of the first slides. So you ran that 01:14:34 17 program? 01:14:38 18 A. Correct. 01:14:38 19 01:14:39 20 Q. And you ran it from this Virtual Box? 01:14:41 21 Α. Correct. And what happened when you ran the program? 01:14:41 22 Q. 01:14:46 23 Α. The software starts up. 01:14:49 24 Q. What do you see on the computer screen?

A. You'll see the LimeWire logo. It's loading.

01:14:51 25

```
It's going to try to connect out when it first starts,
01:14:55
        1
            but it can't because we don't allow it network access.
01:14:59
        2
01:15:02
            And again, LimeWire is shut down.
        3
                    Okav. So is this a home screen for LimeWire?
01:15:05
               Ο.
        4
                    This is not the home screen. This is the library
01:15:09
01:15:12
            screen.
                      The home screen would connect and show you the
        7
            LimeWire logo.
01:15:15
                  What sort of information is contained in this
01:15:16
        8
               Q.
01:15:19
            library screen?
                    This is virtually the same -- actually the same
01:15:20
            file list that was in the LimeWire saved. This is
01:15:25
       11
01:15:28
       12
            actually accessing that folder through the LimeWire
01:15:30
       13
            program.
               Q. Okay. So up here in the top right-hand corner,
01:15:31
       14
            what do we have there?
01:15:40
       15
01:15:40
                    The number of files within this folder.
       16
               Α.
                    And is that number the same or different from the
01:15:42
       17
               Ο.
            number of files that were in the LimeWire saved folder
01:15:45
       18
            that we just looked at?
01:15:47
       19
01:15:48
       20
               Α.
                    It's the same.
01:15:57
       21
                    Any special skills required to view or run
               Ο.
01:16:00
       22
            LimeWire on this computer?
01:16:01
       23
               Α.
                   Double click.
01:16:03
       24
               Q.
                   Any password or anything required to get here
      25
            beyond the password to get get in initially?
01:16:06
```

```
01:16:09
        1
               Α.
                   No.
01:16:09
                   Any special software training needed to see
        2
               Q.
01:16:12
            what's in this library folder?
        3
01:16:13
               Α.
                   No.
        4
01:16:14
                   It is available just to the user of the program?
        5
               Q.
01:16:16
               Α.
                   Yes.
        6
                   And here, what's displayed here?
01:16:17
        7
               Q.
               A. File contents of the folder, the same in the
01:16:27
        8
01:16:31
            LimeWire saved. I see some still photos, a movie.
                   These names, where do these names come from?
01:16:38
       10
01:16:40
            this something that LimeWire makes up, or where do these
       11
            names come from?
01:16:43
       12
01:16:44
       13
               Α.
                    These names are the file names. The files are
            named, and the user can change a file name.
01:16:47
       14
01:16:49
       15
               Q. Any file names here consistent with child
            pornography?
01:16:53
01:16:53
                   Absolutely.
       17
               Α.
               Q. Could you identify one?
01:16:54
       18
               A. "Laurie, 10 YO," which means ten year old,
01:16:55
       19
01:17:00
       20
            "daughter, skirt, panties, preteen, dog."
                   What's this screen?
01:17:21
       21
               Ο.
01:17:25
       22
                    I can't see it well, but it looks like the
01:17:30
       23
            library. Scroll down farther. Another shot.
01:17:36
      24
               Q.
                  What are these items at the bottom?
```

A. Those are incomplete downloads. With LimeWire

25

01:17:39

```
you have the option of starting a download. If for some
01:17:42
        1
            reason the host that you're downloading the file from
01:17:46
        2
            goes offline or you go offline, you have the option of
01:17:48
        3
01:17:51
            resuming that download when you come back online.
        4
            are incomplete downloads.
01:17:55
01:18:07
                    This screen, please describe it.
               Α.
        7
                    The same folder, farther down, farther down in
01:18:10
            the files.
01:18:15
        8
01:18:22
                    And what are some of these files?
        9
               Q.
                   Stills and videos.
01:18:25
       10
               Α.
                    Anything there that would be indicative of child
01:18:27
       11
               Q.
01:18:31
       12
            pornography?
01:18:31
       13
               Α.
                    The top file, "13 year old fucks her dad."
                   And this screen?
01:18:49
       14
               Ο.
01:18:51
       15
                    This is the public shared folder within the
               Α.
            LimeWire software.
01:18:54
       16
                    Hold on a second. Previously which folder have
01:18:56
       17
               Q.
            we been looking at?
01:19:03
       18
                    We were in the library.
01:19:03
       19
               Α.
01:19:05
       20
               Q.
                    Is the library folder on this zoom here?
01:19:08
       21
                    It's the top folder.
               Α.
01:19:09
       22
                    Now you've moved down to the one below?
               Q.
01:19:12
       23
               Α.
                    Correct.
01:19:13
      24
               Q.
                    What is a public shared folder?
       25
                    That is the folder on -- within LimeWire on your
01:19:15
                Α.
```

```
computer that is shared when you're on LimeWire on the
01:19:18
        1
            Gnutella network that is shared for other users.
01:19:22
        2
            they have done a key word search and you have a file
01:19:25
        3
            that they want, they can download it from you.
01:19:28
        4
                    On the left we have highlighted there public
01:19:33
01:19:37
            shared; is that correct?
        7
                    I can't see that highlighted, but yes.
01:19:38
               Α.
                    The shading is not the greatest.
01:19:46
        8
               Q.
                    I can tell it is by the warning on the bottom.
01:19:54
        9
               Α.
                    We'll get to that in a second. These items here,
01:19:57
       10
               Ο.
            what are those?
01:20:03
       11
01:20:05
       12
               Α.
                    Those are the contents of this folder.
01:20:11
       13
               Q.
                    And are any of those file names indicative of
01:20:16
       14
            child pornography?
01:20:18
       15
               Α.
                    Most of them. Youth, jail bait, private,
            daughter, PEDO.
01:20:22
       16
               Ο.
                  In the center here.
01:20:37
       17
                    You mentioned LimeWire allows you to share that
01:20:44
       18
            files with others?
01:20:49
       19
01:20:50
       20
               Α.
                   Other users on the network.
                   Other LimeWire users?
01:20:52
       21
               Ο.
01:20:53
       22
                    It could be other LimeWire users, FrostWire,
               Α.
01:20:57
       23
            Shareaza.
                        LimeWire is a tool to get onto this world
01:21:01
       24
            network.
       25
               Q. Do people pay to get onto the Gnutella network?
01:21:01
```

01:21:05 1 Α. No. Is it limited to Ohio, midwest? 01:21:06 2 Q. All over the world. 01:21:08 3 Α. And please, if you could read the sentence here 01:21:09 4 Q. that's in the middle of the screen. 01:21:12 "Files in this list are shared anonymously with 01:21:14 Α. the world." 7 01:21:17 What does that mean? 01:21:17 8 Q. It's letting you know that anything that is 01:21:19 Α. within this folder, when you are online on the network, 01:21:21 other users can download from you. 01:21:25 11 What do we have here? 01:21:40 12 Q. This is the same folder, just again farther down 01:21:43 13 into the file list. 01:21:46 14 Q. So there is public shared. It still has the same 01:21:47 15 warning in the middle about anonymous sharing? 01:21:49 Α. 01:21:53 17 Yes. Here? 01:21:58 18 Ο. Α. Same. Same file list farther down. 01:21:58 19 01:22:06 20 Q. And what sorts of images are these? Those are JPEGs or EMPs without the file 01:22:09 21 Α. 01:22:15 22 extension. I can't tell you from here, but they're 01:22:17 23 still photos.

Q. Any words there indicative of child pornography?

01:22:21 25 A. Kiddie porn.

01:22:18

- What's this screen? 01:22:42 1 Q.
 - This is going to be the options menu from within 2 Α. the LimeWire software. 3
 - Q. What does the options menu tell you?
 - It allows you to make some changes to how the program works, what the program does, whether it loads at startup. And in this case it allows you to turn off downloaded files going into your public shared if you choose to do that.
 - This is a blown up portion of the screen. says "sharing." What does this indicate?
 - A. It's just telling you how to modify what you are sharing on the internet, where to find it, how to modify it.
 - Q. That last line, "Add files I download from P2P users to my public shared list," what does that mean?
 - A. What that's telling the software, when I'm downloading from the Gnutella network from another user, when the download completes, automatically put it into my shared folder.
 - This is a checkmark by that line. What does that 0. checkmark mean?
 - A. You can turn it off.
 - Q. In the case is it turned off or on?
 - Α. No.

- 01:22:43
- 01:22:47
- 01:22:49

- 01:22:52 5
- 01:22:54
- 7 01:22:59
- 01:23:06 8
- 01:23:09
- 01:23:18 10
- 01:23:22 11
- 01:23:24 12
- 01:23:28 13
- 01:23:31 14
- 01:23:34 15
- 01:23:39
- 01:23:42 17
- 01:23:45 18
- 01:23:49 19
- 01:23:53 20
- 01:23:55 21
- 01:23:59 22
- 01:24:00 23
- 01:24:01 24
- 25 01:24:04

```
Off or on?
01:24:05
        1
               Q.
               Α.
                   It's on.
01:24:06
        2
01:24:17
               Q. One other set of slides, Detective Morford, if I
        3
01:24:17
        4
            may.
                    What is this screen?
01:24:42
        5
01:24:43
                    This is actually the "about" screen off that
        6
            LimeWire software that I was running in the Virtual Box
        7
01:24:45
            just showing the software version is the reason I took a
01:24:48
        8
01:24:53
            shot of it.
               O. What LimeWire version is it?
01:24:53
01:24:55
               A. 5.3.6.
       11
01:24:58
       12
               Q. And that is the software version that you have at
            TPD, or is that the software version that's on the
01:25:02
       13
            laptop in front of you?
01:25:05
       14
                    That is the software version that's on that
01:25:06
       15
            laptop.
01:25:09
       16
               O. What is this screen?
01:25:13
       17
                    That is the contents of a CD that we made with
01:25:15
       18
               Α.
            the "install executable" for LimeWire 5.3.6.
01:25:20
       19
01:25:24
       20
               Q.
                  What is this item that's been highlighted here?
                    That's the install, the executable file to
01:25:26
       21
               Α.
            install that software.
01:25:29
       22
01:25:30
       23
                   What do you mean "executable file"?
01:25:32
       24
               A. When you double click on that file, you run this
```

program, which will start the install process to install

25

01:25:35

```
LimeWire on your computer.
01:25:38
        1
               Ο.
                    What's this screen?
01:25:53
        2
                    This is the first notice that you get when you
01:25:55
        3
               Α.
01:25:59
            run that. It's asking you if you want to allow this
        4
            piece of software to make changes to your operating
01:26:02
        5
01:26:05
            system.
        6
        7
                    This screen?
01:26:09
               Ο.
                    If you click "yes" you get the install beginning.
01:26:10
        8
01:26:14
            This is telling you what you're installing to start
        9
            going through the the install process.
01:26:17
       10
                   What's this screen?
01:26:22
               Ο.
       11
01:26:23
       12
               A. File path, where the software is installed.
                                                                     The
01:26:28
       13
            default file path where the software itself is
            installed.
01:26:31
       14
01:26:35
       15
               Q.
                  And what does this depict?
                    This is the progress bar showing the installation
01:26:36
       16
               Α.
            occurring. We installed this on a virtual machine of
01:26:39
       17
            our own.
01:26:42
       18
                    And what does this indicate?
01:26:46
       19
               Q.
01:26:47
       20
               Α.
                    It's showing you the installation completed and
            you can run the software. Hit "finish" when that
01:26:52
       21
01:27:01
       22
            install is done.
01:27:02
       23
                         THE COURT: How much longer?
01:27:04
       24
                         MR. CRAWFORD: I would anticipate about 30
01:27:06 25
            minutes.
```

```
THE COURT: I have a brief conference, so it
01:27:07
        1
            will take me about ten minutes probably.
01:27:11
        2
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Right now, Judge?
01:27:14
        3
01:27:15
                          THE COURT: Why don't we take our recess.
         4
                          (Recess taken.)
01:34:11
        5
01:46:13
                         THE COURT: You may resume.
        6
        7
01:46:17
                         You understand you remain under oath?
                          THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.
01:46:20
        8
01:46:22
            BY MR. CRAWFORD:
                    Continuing with Exhibit 18, was LimeWire
01:46:22
01:46:29
            installed on the computer in front of you there?
       11
01:46:32
       12
               Α.
                    Yes.
01:46:33
       13
                    And do you recall what version of LimeWire was
            installed?
01:46:37
       14
                    5.3.6.
01:46:38
       15
                Α.
                    In the images I showed you, Exhibit 18 here,
01:46:40
       16
                Q.
            those are images that depict what?
01:46:44
       17
                    This is the desktop of our virtual machine.
01:46:47
       18
                Α.
                    And the previous slides that we looked at
01:46:50
       19
                Q.
01:46:53
       20
            depicted?
               Α.
                    LimeWire being installed on this machine.
01:46:54
        21
01:46:57
       22
                    Are these the same sort of steps that someone
01:47:00
       23
            installing LimeWire on that computer or any other
01:47:03
       24
            computer would have to go through in order to install
       25
            LimeWire?
01:47:05
```

```
01:47:06
         1
                Α.
                    Yes.
01:47:07
                Q.
                    So back to Exhibit 18 here. What is this image?
         2
01:47:11
                    This is the desktop showing the shortcut to
         3
                Α.
            LimeWire.
01:47:14
         4
                    Is this the shortcut to LimeWire?
01:47:14
         5
                Ο.
01:47:21
                Α.
                    Yes.
         6
        7
                    And is that the same shortcut as on Government's
01:47:22
                Q.
            Exhibit 7 in front of you there?
01:47:26
        8
01:47:27
        9
                Α.
                    Yes.
                    And 5.3.6 indicates what?
01:47:27
        10
                Ο.
                    The software version.
01:47:31
        11
                Α.
                   And what is this screen?
01:47:47
        12
                Q.
                   This is LimeWire's legal terms of use and
01:47:50
       13
                Α.
            copyright information the first time you run the
01:47:54
        14
            software.
01:47:57
        15
                    In order to get to this screen, what did you do
01:48:00
       16
                Ο.
            in the virtual machine?
01:48:04
        17
                Α.
                    I would have double clicked the LimeWire 5.3.6
01:48:05
       18
            icon.
01:48:10
        19
01:48:10
        20
                Q.
                    To get to their software, what do you have to do?
01:48:11
        21
                    You have to agree to the terms of their use
                Α.
01:48:17
        22
                    I take it you agreed?
                Α.
01:48:18
        23
                Α.
                    Correct.
                    What is this screen?
01:48:19
       24
                Q.
       25
                A. Basic configurations settings. Do you want
01:48:20
```

LimeWire to launch in your system tray when you start 01:48:23 1 your computer? Do you want to take part in an anonymous 01:48:26 2 survey in order to make their product better? 01:48:30 3 01:48:32 And what do those boxes with the Xs on the left 4 Ο. indicate? 01:48:36 01:48:36 Α. You can turn those options off. 7 Q. And since you're running this on a virtual 01:48:39 01:48:43 machine, are these Xs that you put in there, or are 8 01:48:45 these Xs that were automatically put in there? Everything on this install including these Xs are 01:48:48 10 default that come up when you run the software. 01:48:52 11 01:48:57 12 Q. In the very top left-hand corner there, what does that information indicate? 01:49:04 13 This is step 2 of the set up the first time you 01:49:05 14 01:49:09 run LimeWire, and it's giving you some information about 15 file sharing. 01:49:11 16 Q. And what does this screen say? 01:49:15 17 This allows you to turn off the option that adds 01:49:18 18 Α. files that you've downloaded from other users on the 01:49:24 19 01:49:27 20 Gnutella network to your public share list. What does this indicate here? 01:49:35 21 Ο. 01:49:36 22 It's turned on by default. 01:49:38 23 Q. What's turned on by default? 01:49:40 24 Α. The adding the files to your public shared by

default, that's where the file you download goes.

01:49:44

```
Someone setting up LimeWire, would they have the
01:49:48
        1
               Q.
            option of un-"X"ing that box?
01:49:52
        2
01:49:55
               Α.
                   Yes.
        3
                    This public shared list, what files go into this
01:49:58
        4
               Q.
            public shared list that are shared with the world?
01:50:04
01:50:06
               A. You can put files from there, from other places
        6
            in your computer if you would like. By "there," any
        7
01:50:09
            files that you download from the Gnutella network will
01:50:12
        8
01:50:15
            automatically go there when the download completes.
                   When we were reviewing Exhibit 15, which was
01:50:18
       10
       11
            Government's Exhibit 7 there in a virtual environment,
01:50:21
01:50:25
       12
            were some of those screen shots of the public shared
            list?
01:50:28
       13
01:50:29
       14
               Α.
                   Yes.
01:50:45
       15
                   Detective Morford, what is an FTK analysis?
               Q.
                     FTK is the software we use to run the analysis
01:50:48
       16
               Α.
            on the image we created. It stands for Forensic
01:50:52
       17
            Toolkit. It is a software developed by Access Data.
01:50:56
       18
            It's an industry standard in law enforcement. It's used
01:50:59
       19
01:51:03
       20
            throughout the world for computer analysis, computer
            forensics.
01:51:06
       21
```

with it, would you do with it in your day-to-day job duties?

Q. Generally what sorts of uses -- what can you do

01:51:07

01:51:09

01:51:14

01:51:15

22

23

24

25

A. We use it everyday. FTK takes the contents of an

```
image or a hard drive directly, if that's what you
01:51:21
        1
01:51:26
            choose to do. It examines the file system.
                                                            It indexes
        2
            all of the words on the computer; it categorizes all of
01:51:30
        3
            the files within the computer as to what type of file it
01:51:35
        4
            is; for example, a document or a graphic or multimedia.
01:51:38
01:51:44
            And it allows me to go look when I do my analysis at
            just the types of files I need without having to sift
        7
01:51:48
            through 300,00 or 400,000 other system files that are
01:51:53
        8
01:51:56
            not important.
                   Did you perform or did you use the FTK software
01:51:57
            to analyze the image of Government's Exhibit 7 there?
01:52:01
       11
                   Yes, I did.
01:52:04
       12
               Α.
01:52:16
       13
                    Let me show you Government's Exhibit 16. What is
            that item?
01:52:18
       14
01:52:19
       15
               Α.
                    That is a copy of the FTK report that I generated
            at the conclusion of my exam.
01:52:23
       16
                    How do you know that's a copy?
01:52:24
       17
               Q.
                   I reviewed it, and it's my initials on the disk.
01:52:25
       18
               Α.
                    Is this your FTK report?
01:53:39
       19
               Q.
01:53:43
       20
               Α.
                   Yes, it is.
                    I'll show you an item on the left here called
01:53:45
       21
               Q.
01:53:49
       22
            bookmarked files. What does this screen indicate?
01:53:58
       23
                    I had this to the report -- or had the report
01:54:00
       24
            generate this to show any file I added as an evidence
            file to my final case report to show the file path.
       25
01:54:04
                                                                      So
```

```
somebody looking at this could see where on the computer
01:54:08
        1
            that file would have resided if you were exploring the
01:54:11
        2
            computer yourself. Everything in blue is an evidence
01:54:14
        3
01:54:19
            item.
        4
                   Do you see that folder called documents?
01:54:25
               Ο.
01:54:27
               Α.
                   Yes.
        6
        7
                   What's there?
               Q.
01:54:28
               Α.
                   That is the documents folder we looked at earlier
01:54:29
        8
            with the LimeWire folder and the LimeWire saved folder
01:54:33
            within it, and then the evidence that I added to the
01:54:36
       10
            case within that.
01:54:38
       11
01:54:43
       12
               Ο.
                   And what are the -- is the blue writing here
            underneath the LimeWire saved?
01:54:47
       13
                   Those are the file names.
01:54:49
       14
               Α.
                   And what is this screen?
01:55:00
       15
               Q.
                   This is the file properties for each file, all of
01:55:02
       16
               Α.
            the file properties I have available for each file that
01:55:06
       17
            I added to the case as an evidence item to include the
01:55:09
       18
            file path, the file name, what type of file it was, the
01:55:12
       19
01:55:17
       20
            logical physical size, created, modified, and accessed
            if it was available. If you scroll down, the hash
01:55:21
       21
01:55:27
       22
            values should be available as well and a link to the
01:55:30
       23
            file.
01:55:38
       24
               Q. Here's one example you'll see file there. What's
      25
            that file name?
01:55:41
```

```
Nine year old or 9YO Jennie nude with legs spread
01:55:42
        1
               Α.
            wide apart.
01:55:46
        2
               Q. Beneath that it says full path. What does full
01:55:48
        3
            path indicate?
01:55:51
        4
                    Full path is where the file was on the computer
01:55:51
01:55:56
            that it came from.
        7
                  Do you see extension JPG? What does that mean?
01:56:02
               Q.
                   That means that it's a still photo.
01:56:07
        8
               Α.
01:56:13
        9
               Q.
                   And what is this link here?
                   That's a link to the photo.
01:56:16
       10
               Α.
01:56:23
                   And is this an image of the photo that goes with
       11
               Q.
01:56:28
       12
            the other properties that you just described?
01:56:31
       1.3
               Α.
                   Yes.
               Q. How about this file here. The same information?
01:57:12
       14
                   The same information.
01:57:14
       15
               Α.
               Q. You have a file name. And what's that file name
01:57:15
       16
            there?
       17
01:57:19
                    Kids teens women porno Lolitas preteens,
01:57:19
       18
               Α.
            hussyfans, underage.
01:57:26
       19
01:57:30
       20
               Q.
                   Are those terms associated with child
01:57:32
       21
            pornography?
01:57:32
       22
                   Most definitely.
01:57:34
       23
               Q.
                    It says extension here, jpg. What does that
            indicate?
01:57:37
      24
      25
              A. It's a photo.
01:57:37
```

```
And this link here, exported as?
01:57:41
         1
                Q.
01:57:43
                    That will be the photo.
         2
                Α.
                Q. And is that the photo that is associated with
01:57:48
         3
            that file name?
01:57:50
         4
                Α.
                    Yes.
01:57:51
         5
                    Detective Morford, this is Government's Exhibit
01:58:22
            17. Do you recognize that item?
        7
01:58:24
                   Yes, I do.
01:58:28
        8
               Α.
01:58:29
                Q.
                    What is that?
                    A slide show of the exploited images from my FTK
01:58:30
        10
                Α.
            report.
01:58:36
       11
01:58:36
       12
                Q.
                    And the images on that disk, where did they come
            from?
01:58:39
       13
                    They came from my FTK report.
01:58:39
       14
                Α.
                    Is that a summary of what's on your FTK report?
01:58:43
       15
                Q.
01:58:46
       16
                Α.
                    Yes.
                Q. Have you had an opportunity to review the images
01:58:47
       17
            on that disk?
01:58:49
       18
01:58:50
       19
                Α.
                    Yes.
01:58:50
       20
                    Are the images on that disk the same that you
                Q.
             found in your FTK analysis?
01:58:53
        21
01:58:55
        22
                Α.
                    Yes, they are.
01:59:35
        23
                Q.
                    What are we looking at here?
01:59:36
       24
                Α.
                    This is the contents of the CD you just put in on
       25
            of the exported images as well as a Microsoft
01:59:40
```

```
PowerPoint.
01:59:43
        1
                    What is that Microsoft PowerPoint?
                Q.
01:59:44
        2
                   Untitled 1.
01:59:46
        3
               Α.
                   And what does it contain?
01:59:48
         4
                Ο.
                    That's going to be the slides above and below.
01:59:49
         5
                Α.
01:59:53
                    And at the bottom here it says movie clip.
         6
                Q.
            are those?
        7
01:59:55
                    Three movies.
01:59:56
        8
               Α.
                    And you've seen these, and they're images that
01:59:57
        9
                Q.
            came from your analysis of Government's Exhibit 7?
02:00:01
        10
02:00:03
                Α.
                   Yes, they did.
        11
02:00:04
        12
                Q. I'll play the first movie and ask you to identify
02:00:07
       13
            it.
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Your Honor, two or three
02:00:28
        14
02:00:29
       15
            movies we've seen before. I was going to play them for
            approximately ten seconds to give Detective Morford an
02:00:32
        16
            opportunity to identify. The third one we have not
02:00:36
       17
            seen; I was going to play it in its entirety.
02:00:38
       18
                          I'll play therefore approximately ten
02:00:41
        19
02:00:44
       20
            seconds, Detective Morford, and you can acknowledge
            whether you recognize it.
02:00:46
        21
02:00:48
        22
                          (Video played in open court.)
02:00:57
        23
                Ο.
                    Detective Morford, is that one of the movies you
02:01:00
       24
            discovered during your FTK analysis?
        25
               Α.
                    Yes.
02:01:04
```

```
(Video shown in open court.)
02:01:07
         1
02:01:42
                    The same question, is this one of the movies
         2
                Q.
            you've seen?
02:01:45
         3
02:01:45
                Α.
                    Yes.
         4
                     (Video shown in open court.)
02:01:59
         5
02:03:39
                Q.
                    Same question. Is that a video you uncovered
         6
            during your FTK analysis?
        7
02:03:42
02:03:44
         8
                Α.
                    Yes.
02:03:45
                Q.
                    These will be still images.
         9
                    (Photographs shown in open court.)
02:04:04
        10
02:05:47
                    Are those images that you recovered during your
        11
                Ο.
02:05:51
        12
            FTK analysis?
02:05:52
        13
                Α.
                    Yes.
                          MR. CRAWFORD: Just a moment, Your Honor.
02:05:56
        14
02:06:36
        15
            BY MR. CRAWFORD:
02:06:36
                    Detective Morford, the last movie we saw, have
       16
                Ο.
            you seen that in other investigations before?
02:06:40
        17
02:06:42
                    Many times.
        18
                Α.
                    And is that a full version of that video?
02:06:43
        19
                Q.
02:06:45
       20
                Α.
                    No.
                    And what have you seen, the full version of that
02:06:47
        21
                Q.
02:06:52
        22
            video, in other investigations?
02:06:54
        23
                Α.
                    The full version is much longer; it's called the
02:06:57
       24
            Baby J video. There are multiple men having sex with
       25
            that little girl. She's probably around five years old.
02:07:00
```

```
MR. CRAWFORD: Judge, if we could approach
02:07:06
        1
            at the side for a second.
02:07:08
        2
02:07:10
                         (Whereupon the following discussion was had
        3
            at the bench outside the hearing of the jury:)
02:08:11
        4
02:08:11
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Judge, that's our last
02:08:11
            witness. Do you want to do exhibits now?
        6
        7
                         THE COURT: She has cross. Wait for her to
02:08:11
            finish the cross-examination.
02:08:11
        8
02:08:11
        9
                         How long do you think cross will be?
                         MS. KELLEY: Very brief.
02:08:11
       10
02:08:11
       11
                         THE COURT: Are there going to be
02:08:11
      12
            objections?
                         MS. KELLEY: Not that I can think of at this
02:08:11
      13
02:08:12
      14
            point.
                         (End of side-bar discussion.)
02:08:21
      15
02:08:28
                        THE COURT: You may examine.
      16
                         MS. KELLEY: Thank you, Your Honor.
02:08:30
      17
02:08:30
      18
                         DAVID MORFORD, CROSS-EXAMINATION
02:08:30
      19
           BY MS. KELLEY:
02:08:32
       20
02:08:32
       21
               Q. Good afternoon. I'm Elizabeth Kelley. I
02:08:34
       22
            represent Alex Cook.
                   Now, you examined a number of different items
02:08:37
      23
02:08:40
      24
           which were seized in Alex's apartment, didn't you?
02:08:44 25
              A. That's correct.
```

```
You examined a thumb drive?
02:08:45
         1
                Q.
02:08:48
                Α.
                     Yes.
         2
02:08:48
                    And memory cards?
         3
                Q.
02:08:51
                Α.
                     Correct.
         4
                    And an Xbox?
02:08:51
         5
                Ο.
02:08:53
                Α.
                    Right.
         6
         7
                    And an iPod?
02:08:53
                Q.
02:08:56
         8
                Α.
                     Yes.
02:08:57
                     And you didn't find any evidence of child
         9
                Q.
             pornography on any of those items, did you?
02:09:01
        10
02:09:03
                Α.
                     No, ma'am.
        11
                     Just found the hard drive?
02:09:04
        12
                Q.
                Α.
02:09:05
        13
                    Yes, ma'am.
                     During the course of your examination, did you
02:09:06
        14
                Q.
             discover when the LimeWire software was actually
02:09:10
        15
             downloaded on to the hard drive?
02:09:14
        16
02:09:17
        17
                Α.
                     No.
                     You didn't? How long did you spend examining
02:09:17
        18
                Ο.
             the hard drive?
02:09:22
        19
02:09:24
        20
                Α.
                     Quite a while.
                     And you never discovered when it was downloaded?
02:09:25
        21
                Ο.
                     I didn't think it was relevant.
02:09:31
        22
                Α.
02:09:35
        23
                     Now, in your FTK report, in virtually every
             single entry the created time, the modified time, and
02:09:46
        24
        25
             the access time was identical. Why was that?
02:09:50
```

```
Because the machine was running Windows Vista,
02:09:53
        1
               Α.
02:09:57
            and Windows Vista by default does not update access
        2
02:10:00
            dates when you access a file.
        3
               Q. All right. So there's really, based on that,
02:10:02
        4
02:10:05
            there's no evidence that any of those files were
02:10:09
            actually opened, is there?
02:10:10
        7
               Α.
                    No.
                    And there's no evidence that they were actually
02:10:11
               Q.
        8
02:10:14
            viewed, is there?
        9
02:10:15
       10
               Α.
                   Nope.
02:10:16
               Q. And there's no evidence that they were actually
       11
02:10:19
            categorized, is there?
02:10:21
       13
               Α.
                    No.
                    Now, there's something called a biometric device
02:10:24
       14
               0.
02:10:29
       15
            on Alex's computer, correct?
02:10:31
               Α.
                    Correct.
       16
                    And tell the jury in a couple quick sentences
02:10:32
       17
            what a biometric device is?
02:10:36
       18
               A. A fingerprint reader.
02:10:38
       19
02:10:43
       20
               Q. And Alex could, once Alex was logged in, he
            didn't need to log in again in his computer, did he, on
02:10:48
       21
02:10:51
       22
            his computer, did he --
02:10:53
       23
               Α.
                    No.
02:10:54
       24
               Q.
                   -- if it had a biometric device?
02:10:56 25
               Α.
                    No.
```

And until the computer was unplugged and 02:10:57 1 Q. disabled, that biometric device would still be in 02:11:00 2 effect, wouldn't it? 02:11:05 3 02:11:09 It would depend on the settings on the machine. 4 Okay. But, in other words, Alex could sign in 02:11:12 5 Q. 02:11:15 once, and that would be it, correct? 7 It's possible, yes. 02:11:17 Α. So, in other words, someone else could sit down 02:11:19 8 Q. in front of Alex's keyboard, and it wouldn't know the 02:11:23 9 difference, would it? 02:11:26 10 Α. No. 02:11:27 11 Q. Now, do you, in fact, know that Alex was the 02:11:32 12 02:11:38 13 person sitting in front of his keyboard every single time? 02:11:40 14 02:11:41 15 Α. No. Q. Now, since only the IP address of the router was 02:11:43 16 the subject of the search warrant, could these files 02:11:52 17 02:11:57 18 have come from any other computer on the network behind the router? 02:12:00 19 02:12:01 20 Α. I guess you're going to have to explain your question. Are you talking about the undercover 02:12:04 21 02:12:06 22 downloaded files? 02:12:07 23 Q. Yes. 02:12:09 24 A. They could have come from any computer on that 25 network. 02:12:11

- 02:12:13 Any computer on that network? 1 Q.
- Behind that router. 02:12:15 Α. 2
- 02:12:18 Did you examine any other computers from that 3 Q. particular apartment?
 - I don't believe so. 5 Α.
 - Q. Do you know how long Alex had this computer?
 - I have no idea. Α.
 - O. How old, if you remember, were some of the oldest files on that computer that weren't child pornography, if you remember?
 - Α. I don't remember. I wouldn't even have paid attention to them.
 - Q. Now, are you familiar with the term MAC address?
 - Α. Yes.
 - Tell the jury again in a couple quick sentences Q. what a MAC address is?
 - A. It's an access control, a MAC address is -- it's kind of like a serial number for a network device. lot of places -- like, for instance, Buckeye Cable used a MAC address to authenticate a router. It's usually unique to that network device.
 - What was the specific MAC address that the files were downloaded from?
 - A. I don't know.
 - Q. You had -- there was a category labeled "Public

- 02:12:24 4
- 02:12:31
- 02:12:34 6
- 7 02:12:38
- 02:12:45 8
- 02:12:50
- 02:12:54 10
- 02:12:54 11
- 02:12:57 12
- 02:12:58 13
- 02:13:06 14
- 02:13:07 15
- 02:13:10 16
- 02:13:11 17
- 02:13:16 18
- 02:13:19 19
- 02:13:22 20
- 02:13:26 21
- 02:13:29 22
- 02:13:32 23
- 02:13:33 2.4
- 25 02:14:04

```
Share," on the computer. Do you recall that?
02:14:09
        1
        2
               A. Yes.
02:14:14
02:14:15
                   Did files appear in that category automatically,
        3
               Q.
            or did they have to be posted there?
02:14:22
        4
                    The Public Shared is populated automatically by
02:14:26
        5
02:14:30
            files downloaded from LimeWire. But you can place files
            in there.
        7
02:14:34
                    And do you know who can place files there?
02:14:35
        8
               Q.
02:14:38
                   Anybody sitting behind the keyboard.
        9
               Α.
                   Anyone in the world -- anyone in the network?
02:14:41
       10
               Q.
                   Not necessarily.
02:14:44
       11
               Α.
02:14:46
       12
               Q.
                   Do you necessarily need to know the person
02:14:49
       13
            posting?
                   Nobody on Gnutella can push a file up to your
02:14:50
       14
            computer. Somebody in that local network could put
02:14:54
       15
            something behind that router if it was shared and opened
02:14:58
       16
            for them to do that.
02:15:03
       17
               Q. But you needn't necessarily know that person,
02:15:04
       18
            would you?
02:15:06
       19
02:15:09
       20
               A. If they're accessing your network, I would think
            you would know who's on your network.
02:15:11
       21
02:15:14
       22
                         MS. KELLEY: Could I have a moment, Your
02:15:20
       23
            Honor?
02:15:20
       2.4
                         (Discussion had off the record.)
       25
                         MS. KELLEY: No more questions. Thank you.
02:15:21
```

```
02:15:28
        1
                        DAVID MORFORD, REDIRECT EXAMINATION
02:15:28
        2
            BY MR. CRAWFORD:
02:15:29
        3
               Q. Detective Morford, you were asked about images
02:15:29
        4
            that were downloaded to Mr. Cook's computer from
02:15:32
02:15:35
        6
            LimeWire?
        7
               A. Yes.
02:15:35
                   Are you a task force member with the Oklahoma
02:15:36
        8
                Q.
02:15:41
        9
            FBI?
02:15:41
       10
                Α.
                    No.
                    Were you involved with that at all?
02:15:41
       11
               Q.
02:15:43
       12
               Α.
                    No.
02:15:43
       13
                Q.
                   Were you asked to do any analysis on the files
            that were downloaded from the Oklahoma FBI?
02:15:46
       14
02:15:48
       15
               A. No.
                         MR. CRAWFORD: Thank you.
02:15:51
       16
                          MS. KELLEY: Nothing further.
02:15:52
       17
                          THE COURT: Any further witnesses from the
02:15:59
       18
02:16:01
       19
            government?
02:16:01
       20
                         MR. CRAWFORD: No, Your Honor.
02:16:03
        21
                          THE COURT: Are you prepared to proceed for
02:16:05
       22
            a bit, or what's your pleasure?
02:16:07
       23
                          MS. KELLEY: We can begin with our first
02:16:09
       24
            witness, Your Honor.
        25
                          THE COURT: Why don't we do that.
02:16:11
```

```
02:16:16
        1
                         MS. KELLEY: Could we approach, though.
02:18:49
                         (Whereupon the following discussion was had
        2
            at the bench outside the hearing of the jury:)
02:18:49
        3
02:18:49
                         THE COURT: What's your timetable? Can we
        4
            get all the evidence to the jury by 3:00 or 4:00
02:18:49
        5
02:18:49
            tomorrow, 3:30, 4:00?
        6
        7
                         MS. KELLEY: I've got six witnesses
02:18:49
02:18:49
        8
            tomorrow.
02:18:49
        9
                         THE COURT: Were you planning to carry over
            until Tuesday?
02:18:49
       10
02:18:49
       11
                         MR. SECOR: Tomorrow's Thursday.
02:18:49
       12
                         MS. KELLEY: I think we, for purposes of the
02:18:50
       13
            record, I need to make a Rule 29 motion.
                         THE COURT: Can we get all the evidence to
02:18:50
       14
02:18:50
       15
            the jury -- can we get the whole case to the jury by
            Friday afternoon?
02:18:50
       16
02:18:50
       17
                         MR. SECOR: I think we can get the whole
02:18:50
       18
            case to the jury by tomorrow.
                         THE COURT: Can you get all your witnesses
02:18:50
       19
02:18:51
       20
            in by tomorrow?
02:18:51
       21
                         MS. KELLEY: They have been told to be here.
02:18:51
       22
            I don't know how quickly we'll plow through them.
02:18:51
       23
                         THE COURT: What will that leave, rebuttal?
02:18:51
       2.4
                         MR. SECOR: Very short rebuttal witnesses.
       25
02:18:51
                         THE COURT: We can at least get the jury
```

```
02:18:51
            charged on Friday?
        1
02:18:51
        2
                         MR. SECOR: Absolutely.
02:18:52
                         MS. KELLEY: I know you're unavailable on
        3
02:18:52
            Friday -- or Monday, excuse me.
        4
02:18:52
        5
                         THE COURT: The jury can deliberate.
02:18:52
        6
            here.
        7
                         MS. KELLEY: That's what I wondered.
02:18:52
                         MR. SECOR: Before we rest, we have to
02:18:52
        8
02:18:52
            discuss these, the exhibits.
        9
                         THE COURT: I'll say that -- why don't you
02:18:53
       10
       11
            say you rest subject to admission of exhibits. I'll
02:18:53
            adjourn, and we'll tidy up our business.
02:18:53
       12
02:18:53
       1.3
                         MR. SECOR: All right.
                         THE COURT: And is that what you're saying?
02:18:53
       14
                         MR. SECOR: Normally we decide on admission
02:18:53
       15
            of the exhibits before we rest.
02:18:53
       16
       17
                         THE COURT: You don't have any objection?
02:18:53
                         MS. KELLEY: No.
02:18:53
       18
                         THE COURT: You can rest subject to
02:18:53
       19
       20
02:18:53
            admission. If there's some problem with the exhibit --
02:18:53
       21
                         MR. SECOR:
                                      I don't see any.
02:18:53
       22
                         (End of sidebar discussion.)
02:18:53
       23
                         THE COURT: Does the government have any
            further witnesses?
02:18:54
       2.4
       25
                         MR. SECOR: We do not, Your Honor. Subject
02:18:55
```

```
to admission of exhibits, the government would rest.
02:18:59
        1
02:19:02
        2
                         THE COURT: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, I
            think we'll adjourn for the day, earlier than I thought.
02:19:04
        3
            Counsel are hopeful that we can actually get the entire
02:19:08
        4
            case into your hands before you go home on Friday.
02:19:13
02:19:17
            don't think it will be possible for you to start
            deliberations, although that will be entirely up to you.
        7
02:19:20
            So it's more likely than not that we'll get the case to
02:19:29
        8
02:19:32
            you, we'll complete everything by Friday afternoon, but
        9
            you'll have to come back on Monday to deliberate.
02:19:38
       10
            see how it goes. But we're actually moving along at a
02:19:41
       11
            better pace than I and counsel had anticipated. In any
02:19:45
       12
02:19:51
       13
            event, we'll adjourn for the evening. We'll start
            tomorrow at 8:30 with defense witnesses. Keep an open
02:19:54
       14
02:20:01
       15
            mind. We'll see you tomorrow morning.
02:20:48
                         (Jury exits the courtroom.)
       16
                         THE COURT: You have Exhibits 1 through 17?
02:23:12
       17
                         MR. SECOR: 1 through 20. 1 was the lead
02:23:15
       18
            disk identified by Special Agent Whisman.
02:23:23
       19
       20
02:23:27
                         THE COURT: Any objection?
                         MS. KELLEY: No, Your Honor.
02:23:28
       21
02:23:31
       22
                         MR. SECOR:
                                     Two was the lead disk summary
02:23:37
       23
            identified by Agent Whisman.
02:23:38
       24
                         THE COURT: Any objection?
       25
                         MS. KELLEY: None, Your Honor.
02:23:39
```

```
MR. SECOR: Three was the Time Warner
02:23:40
        1
02:23:42
        2
            subpoena identified by Special Agent Whisman.
02:23:45
        3
                         MS. KELLEY:
                                       No.
                         MR. SECOR: Four was the Time Warner
02:23:47
        4
        5
            subpoena response identified by Special Agent Whisman
02:23:49
            and the Time Warner records custodian.
02:23:53
        6
        7
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
02:23:57
                         THE COURT: One through four will all be
02:24:00
        8
02:24:02
        9
            admitted.
                         MR. SECOR: Five was the, quote-unquote,
02:24:03
       10
            Jennie image identified by Amy Allen.
02:24:05
       11
02:24:09
       12
                         MS. KELLEY: No, no objection.
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:24:11
       13
02:24:12
       14
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 6 was the quote-unquote
            Vicki video identified by Roy Shepherd.
02:24:14
       15
02:24:19
       16
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: Admitted.
02:24:20
       17
02:24:23
       18
                         MR. SECOR: Number 7 was the laptop computer
       19
            identified by Special Agents Schulte, Smith, Russ, Jones
02:24:26
       20
            and TPD Officer Morford.
02:24:32
       21
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
02:24:39
02:24:40
       22
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:24:41
       23
                         MR. SECOR: Eight is the Miranda waiver
02:24:43
       24
            identified by Special Agents Pape and Schulte.
       25
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
02:24:47
```

```
MR. SECOR: Number 9 is the signed statement
02:24:51
        1
02:24:53
        2
            identified by Special Agent Pape.
02:24:58
        3
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: They will be admitted.
02:24:59
        4
02:25:02
        5
                         MR. SECOR: Number 10 was the search warrant
02:25:04
        6
            photo identified by Special Agent Jones.
                         MS. KELLEY: That was the photo of the
        7
02:25:10
            bedroom? No objection.
02:25:11
        8
02:25:13
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 11 was the cable bill
02:25:15
       10
02:25:19
       11
            identified by Special Agent Jones.
02:25:23
       12
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:25:24
       13
                         MR. SECOR: 12 was the resumé identified by
02:25:26
       14
            Special Agent Jones.
02:25:31
       15
02:25:32
       16
                         MS. KELLEY: Objection as to relevance.
                         THE COURT: I think not. I think it's
02:25:37
       17
       18
            relevant. Objection noted and overruled.
                                                          It shows a
02:25:39
            degree of educational obtainment. Whether it was
02:25:43
       19
02:25:47
       20
            prepared by him or someone else, it was in his
            possession, which would indicate constructive adoption.
02:25:50
       21
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit number 13.
02:25:57
       22
02:26:01
       23
                         THE COURT: If there's some reason to change
02:26:06
      24
            that ruling during the defense case, renew your request.
       25
                         It will be admitted.
02:26:10
```

```
02:26:12
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 13, consent to search
        1
02:26:15
        2
            the truck identified by Special Agents Schulte and Pape.
02:26:20
        3
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:26:21
        4
02:26:23
        5
                         MR. SECOR: Four, consent to search the
02:26:24
        6
            apartment identified by Special Agents Schulte and Russ.
        7
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
02:26:29
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:26:30
        8
02:26:35
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 15 was the laptop
            computer screen shots that was identified by TPD officer
02:26:37
       10
            Morford.
02:26:43
       11
02:26:44
       12
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:26:45
       13
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 16 was the FTK report
02:26:46
       14
            disk, again identified by TPD Agent Morford.
02:26:49
       15
02:26:54
       16
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:26:55
       17
       18
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 17 was the FTK report
02:26:57
            summary disk again identified by TPD Officer Morford.
02:26:59
       19
02:27:06
       20
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:27:07
       21
02:27:08
       22
                         MR. SECOR: Exhibit 18, LimeWire install
02:27:11
       23
            screen shots, those were identified by TPD Officer
            Morford.
02:27:16
       2.4
       25
                        MS. KELLEY: No objection.
02:27:16
```

```
THE COURT: It will be admitted.
02:27:18
        1
                         MR. SECOR: 19 was not offered. And 20 is
02:27:19
        2
            the evidence log, which was identified and testified to
02:27:23
        3
02:27:26
            by Special Agent Russ.
        4
                         MS. KELLEY: No objection.
02:27:28
        5
02:27:29
                         THE COURT: It will be admitted.
        6
        7
                         Okay. Government rests?
02:27:31
                         MR. SECOR:
02:27:33
        8
                                      We do.
                         MS. KELLEY: Thank you, Your Honor.
02:27:34
        9
            would like to make a Rule 29 motion for acquittal at
02:27:36
       10
            this point. The government has not put forth sufficient
02:27:39
       11
            evidence at this point to prove that it was Alex Cook
02:27:44
       12
02:27:48
       13
            who put these objects on his computer. They have not
            proved that even if the objects were on his computer he
02:27:52
       14
02:27:57
       15
            knowingly put them on his computer. Beyond that, they
            have not put forward sufficient evidence to show that
02:28:02
       16
            the alleged confession was knowing, intelligent, and
02:28:05
       17
02:28:09
       18
            voluntary.
                         MR. SECOR: Briefly, Your Honor, as the
02:28:14
       19
02:28:15
       20
            Court, I'm sure, is well aware, at this stage of the
            proceeding the Court looks at the evidence in the light
02:28:17
       21
02:28:19
       22
            most favorable to the government. As far as the
02:28:22
       23
            voluntariness of the confession or the statement, the
02:28:27
       24
            Court heard, the jury heard all sorts of testimony
       25
            relative to the defendant's demeanor, to his
02:28:30
```

```
willingness, to his intelligence, to his soberness, all
02:28:33
        1
            of the indicia regarding the voluntariness of the
02:28:39
        2
            confession.
02:28:44
        3
02:28:45
                         As far as the knowledge is concerned, that
        4
            can be imputed from the nature of the items seized on
02:28:47
        5
            the computer, and the nature of the files, and the
02:28:51
        7
            number of files, the period of time over which they had
02:28:57
            been accumulated, which can be all viewed on Exhibits 14
02:29:01
        8
            through 18.
02:29:08
        9
                         I have nothing further.
02:29:13
       10
                         THE COURT: I'm going to overrule the
       11
02:29:14
            motion. I think that there's sufficient evidence for
02:29:16
       12
02:29:18
       13
            the case to go to the jury and for a rational jury to
            decide on the basis of what's before it now that the
02:29:23
       14
02:29:27
       15
            defendant's quilty beyond a reasonable doubt. It's not
            to say that it will, but that's not the standard at this
02:29:30
       16
            point.
02:29:33
       17
02:29:34
                         Anything further from the government?
       18
                         MR. SECOR: No, Your Honor.
02:29:36
       19
02:29:36
       20
                         THE COURT: Ms. Kelley?
02:29:37
       21
                         MS. KELLEY: Nothing further.
       22
                         THE COURT: We'll see you in the morning.
02:29:40
       23
                         (Adjourned at 4:08 p.m.)
       24
       25
```

CERTIFICATE I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter. /s Tracy L. Spore Tracy L. Spore, RMR, CRR Date

| 1 | I N D E X | |
|----|---|-------------|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | <u>Examinations</u> | <u>Page</u> |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., DIRECT EXAMINATION | 186 |
| 6 | BY MS. KELLEY: | |
| 7 | WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., CROSS-EXAMINATION | 199 |
| 8 | BY MR. CRAWFORD: | |
| 9 | WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., REDIRECT EXAMINATION | 207 |
| 10 | BY MS. KELLEY: | |
| 11 | WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., RECROSS-EXAMINATION | 210 |
| 12 | BY MR. CRAWFORD: | |
| 13 | WAYNE GRAVES, Ph.D., FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION | 211 |
| 14 | BY MS. KELLEY: | |
| 15 | DAVID MORFORD, DIRECT EXAMINATION | 214 |
| 16 | BY MR. CRAWFORD: | |
| 17 | DAVID MORFORD, CROSS-EXAMINATION | 248 |
| 18 | BY MS. KELLEY: | |
| 19 | DAVID MORFORD, REDIRECT EXAMINATION | 254 |
| 20 | BY MR. CRAWFORD: | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| | | |